Strengthening the National Human Rights Institution (NHRI) according to the Paris Principles

Following multiple evaluations and recommendations by international human rights institutions,reform of the Moldovan NHRI was included as an objective in the National Human Rights Action Plan for 2011-2014ⁱ and as a strategic area in the Judicial Sector Reform Strategy for 2011-2016ⁱⁱ.

The new Law No. 52 on People's Advocate (Ombudsman) approved by Parliament on 03.04.2014does not provide adequately for reform of the institution and strengthening its capacities. Gaps have been also identified in the new regulatory frame work that impede the execution of the mandate of the Ombudsperson and the institution. Some provisions of the law have been declared unconstitutional. ⁱⁱⁱ Upon request of the Ombudsperson, the Venice Commission delivered its opinion^{iv}about some issues related to the new NHRI model chosen by Moldova, and the Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law of the Council of Europe^vgave an opinion about the gaps in Law No.52/03/04/2014regarding the establishment and operation of the National Preventive Mechanism against Torture. Legal complications undermine the operation of the Child's Ombudsperson and the National Preventive Mechanism against Torture, the rank and the remuneration of the Ombudsperson, his functional independence and independence from other institutions, and the financial resources of the Ombudsperson's Office.

Two major issues for the NHRI are the insufficient funding and the lack of adequate premises. The institution is located in a damaged building and the Government has, over several years, not been able to identify, a building that meets the requirements of the institution^{vi}.

Recommendations:

- Revise Law No. 52 to ensure that it meets international standards and good practice;
- Provide suitable premises and facilities for the Ombudsperson's Office and properly fund the activities of the Ombudsperson.

Rights of the Child

Inclusion of children with disabilities

Inclusion of children with special education needs and disabilities (SEND)^{vii} requires the development of support services for teaching staff, the parents and the children with special needs^{viii}. In 2014-2015, there were 101 deinstitutionalised children with SEND studying, while in 2015-2016 - there were 591 children^{ix}. There is an increasing need for support services.

Recommendations:

- Adapt education institutions to respond to the needs of children with disabilities;
- Provide regular training for teaching staff;
- Develop the necessary mechanisms and tools;

Right of the child to being raised in a family environment

The residential childcare system reform^x is encumbered by:insufficient alternative services to the residential institutions; inaction by guardianship bodies responsible for the assistance and protection of orphan children and children without parental care;insufficient funding for social services (guardianship/trusteeship, professional parental care,family-type houses); and inadequate allowances for orphan children and children without parental care.

Guardianship authorities fail to monitor properly the situation of deinstitutionalised children. Contrary to the legislation, the placement of children from residential institutions in accordance with the minimal care standards has not been revised^{xi};orphan children graduates of residential institutions are not provided with dwelling space/social housing^{xii}.

Recommendations:

- hold accountable the actors responsible for the social assistance and protection of orphan children and children without parental care;
- provide sufficient funds for the establishment and operation of alternative services.

Preventing and combating child labour exploitation

The legislation^{xiii}sets out the age and conditions for child employment. During the reporting period, policies have been developed and implemented for preventing and combating child

labour exploitation xiv and sanctions for the violations related to child labour have been tightened xv. Official statistics show a decrease of this phenomenon xvi.

Traditionally, minors are involved in labour in agriculture, the processing industry, wholesale and retail trade, etc. They usually come from disadvantaged families.

Recommendation:

• Undertake information campaigns, particularly for vulnerable groups, as well as efficient implementation of the existing mechanisms for monitoring the employment and sanctioning employers who violate the law.

Juvenile justice

Progress was made in strengthening juvenile justice by establishing new mechanisms and implementing them^{xvii}. However,there is no legal and institutional framework for sanctioning and re-educating minors who commit crimes but who may not be held criminally accountable.

Recommendations:

- provide sufficient financial and human resources;
- implement mechanisms for collection and processing of data about the juvenile justice system viii;
- establish an institutional and legal framework for children who committed crimes stipulated by criminal law but have not reached the age of criminal liability;
- strengthen the role of authorities in re-socializing and reintegrating minors;
- develop and implement a national plan for preventing and combating juvenile delinquency^{xix}.

Securing Qualitative Healthcare Services

The lack of proper tools for implementing health legislation leads to irregularities in the system, which limits access to and the quality of healthcare services. There is a shortage of competent staff in the field of public health, particularly in rural areas, as a result of the exodus of specialists and the unsatisfactory infrastructure and sanitary-hygienic condition of healthcare facilities. Obsolete medical equipment and insufficient technical and material resources access by the population to quality medical services and demotivate medical staff. Because the latter have to work in difficult conditions, facing fatigue and insufficient remuneration, many leave the healthcare system.

Another healthcare issue is securing and monitoring the quality and safety of services provided. The procurement of medicines in public healthcare facilities is based on the lowest price, which does not always ensure the best quality. Healthcare facilities, particularly in rural areas, lack sufficient equipment and medicines for quality first aid. This leads to an avoidable high mortality rate. The accreditation of public healthcare facilities is a formality— without thorough control of hospital conditions, the quality and safety of the equipment used, and adequate assessment of patients' satisfaction. There are no efficient procedures for examination of petitions and medical errors and for centralised monitoring of malpractice cases. Observance by health professionals of patients' rights, particularly the rights to private life, to choice and to being informed, is low. There is unequal access to some specialised services such as medication for the people suffering from cancer and HIV/AIDS and qualified palliative care. The existing system for control and prevention of tuberculosis, protection of reproductive health and sexual health is inefficient and sexual health is inefficient.

The healthcare system is marked by corruption, which is driven by poverty and lack of efficient tools to fight this phenomenon. Around 93% of the Moldovans provide informal payments to doctors and other medical staff. Yearly, such payments amount to the equivalent of 100 million USD. Informal payments are also widespread among people who do not hold a health insurance policy. Around 80% of citizens who address to the Ministry of Health, complain about being forced to make informal payments to doctors xxii.

Recommendations:

• the state should develop the necessary tools to create and promote zero tolerance of corruption within the health system;

- an independent institution should be established to investigate malpractice cases and legal mechanisms should be developed to secure patients' rights to receive compensation for any kind of damage caused by medical acts.
- the criteria for evaluation of the standards for accreditation of healthcare and pharmaceutical facilities should be revised;
- compliance criteria should be introduced to require observance of human rights during the provision of medical services. These should be focused on quality, security and safety requirements of medical law, for both the patient and medical staff.

Quality and Accessibility of Drinking Water

The quality of drinking water and access to it remains a serious problem for Moldova. The volume of water currently available is about 500 m³ per capita or even less^{xxiii}. The management of water resources is flawed and unbalanced, and the quality poor. The share of Only 62% of inhabitants have permanent access to improved water sources, and only 56.6% have improved sewerage systems. There is a significant difference between rural (22.8%) and urban (68.9%) areas in access to water supply services, while in terms of access to the public sewerage system, the difference is even more alarming – 1% compared to 50.1%. xxiv

Maintenance of water supply and sewerage systems is done within the limits of existing financial and economic resources. Such systems continue to degrade, causing loss of water and energy resources. The institutions working in water supply and sanitation are fragmented, have limited resources to ensure efficient management of current issues and to plan medium and long term investments. Budgetary constraints mean financing from public funds is low.

Recommendations:

- improve the operational and financial performance of water supply enterprises to increase the safety and quality of services provided to the population;
- increase the efficiency of sectoral policies for the oversight, management and protection of water resources; and
- monitor the water quality at national level in a systematic and coordinated manner.

Independence, Transparency and Efficiency of the Judiciary

Under the Justice Sector Reform Strategy for 2011-2016^{xxv}(JSRS), a number of laws have been adopted/amended and actions have been undertaken to ensure the accessibility and independence of the judiciary and to increase its transparency and efficiency^{xxvi}. However, no progress has been made in strengthening the integrity of judicial actors: anti-corruption measures and professional conduct standards have not been implemented in all judicial institutions; and there is insufficient promotion of intolerance towards corruption.

The judicial system is perceived by the population as being corrupt. This affects seriously the credibility of the justice delivered and fuels distrust by citizens of the integrity of the individuals working in this field. Bi-annual surveys conducted by the Public Policy Institute^{xxvii} since 2003 show a dramatic decrease of citizens' confidence in justice, from 26% in May 2012 to 12% in November 2015.

Recommendations:

- eradicate corruption in the system;
- ensure the continuity of the reform by identifying and developing a general framework for future policies after expiry of JSRS; continue efforts to build a justice system that is accessible, efficient, independent, transparent, professional, and accountable to citizens.

Securing Minimal Detention Conditions

Detention conditions in Moldovan penitentiaries have not improved significantly nor yet attained a level to avoid amounting to inhuman or degrading treatment. The Ombudsman has identified a systemic problem with overpopulation of the prisons, hygiene conditions, poor quality and insufficient quantity of food, and lack of proper healthcare^{xxviii}. This is reinforced by the decisions of the European Court for Human Rights^{xxix}.

The economic crisis has resulted in the cessation of capital investments since July 2015, making it impossible to implement policies adopted to improve the infrastructure of

custodial facilities in line with standards,or to develop and implement construction/renovation plans.xxx

Although the law^{xxxi}sets out detention standards and criminalises intentional inhuman or degrading treatment applied, there are no effective mechanisms to enable the authorities to examine complaints related to detention conditions and to provide effective remedies^{xxxii}.

Recommendations:

- speed up the construction of arrest houses and renovate detention facilities;
- take action to guarantee efficient remedies (with preventive and compensatory effect) for improper detention conditions in violation of the law and international treaties.

Preventing Human Trafficking

The lack of information and the deplorable social and economic condition of vulnerable groups are key factors that encourage human trafficking. Information campaigns have been conducted to prevent and fight this phenomenon and the Service for Assistance to and Protection of the Victims of Human Trafficking (HT) was established **xxiii*. The legal framework has been amended **xxiv* to make a distinction between forced labour and HT for purpose of labour exploitation and between pimping and HT for purpose of sexual exploitation. Sanctions have been tightened for child trafficking, pimping and the organisation of begging, and the commission of HT crimes by national and international civil servants. Beneficiaries of services of HT victims have been criminalised, as has the trafficking of organs and the advertising of the sale and purchase of organs.

However, official statistics^{xxxv} do not yet show a consistent trend down wards in the number of crimes in this area.^{xxxvi}

Recommendation:

• continue priority actions in the HT area, including information campaigns; measures for economic rehabilitation of socially vulnerable groups; support for the start-up of small and medium businesses, particularly in rural areas.

Ensuring Gender Equality

Gender disparity is still an issue. On the labour market, women are overrepresented in low paid occupations and underrepresented in leadership positions. Roma women, women with disabilities, and other vulnerable groups are frequently excluded from public life.

Recommendation:

• continue affirmative action to strengthen the legal framework, including by: establishing the a minimum quota for women on the electoral lists of political parties; promoting gender equality; and eliminating gender stereotypes from the educational curriculum.

Preventing and Combating Domestic Violence

Official statistics show an increased number of domestic violence cases (2012–6569; 2013-6706; 2014-7338; 2015-9203) and inefficient intervention by the authorities responsible for protection of victims.

Recommendations:

- further improve the existing regulatory framework;
- ratify the Council of Europe Convention on preventing and combating violence against women and domestic violence;
- increase information for citizens through permanent awareness campaigns;
- secure sufficient funding for services designed to assist and protect victims of domestic violence.

Ensuring the Rights of Persons with Disabilities

During the reporting period, the regulatory framework for ensuring the implementation of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities was adopted *xxxvii*. However,insufficient mechanisms for implementing the Convention have been developed.

Persons with disabilities are not treated as equal members of the society: they have low accessibility to social infrastructure, transportation, and information; insufficient social services at community level; low levels of employment; and social benefits under the minimal subsistence level^{xxxviii}. Persons with mental disabilities are denied the right to vote, free access to

justice and the right to establish a family.

Recommendation:

- to ratify the optional protocol to the Convention;
- establish an independent mechanism for monitoring the implementation of the Convention;
- eliminate the barriers that deny persons with disabilities an independent life and full participation in all aspects of life;
- develop and implement mechanisms for integration of persons with disabilities on the labour market:
- raise social awareness;
- challenge stereotypes about persons with disabilities;
- ensure the right of each person to exercise his/her legal capacity by abolishing the legal provisions regarding the mechanism for substitution of decisions and replacing it with a mechanism for support in exercising their legal capacity.

Securing a Decent Standard of Living

The economic crisis and constant increases in prices and tariffs for consumer goods and services further affect the living standard of the population in general and lead to the impoverishment of the most vulnerable groups.

The existing pension system is unfair and unsustainable. The indicators for calculating the pension are out-dated. The Ombudsman has notified the Government that the average monthly pension does not cover the minimal subsistence level for retired people. **xxix**. An analysis of official data**lfor the past 3 years shows that the average pension received by around 98% of the total number of retired persons is below the minimum subsistence level**li*.

The national minimum wage^{xlii} does not cover the minimum subsistence level^{xliii}. The Law on Minimal Subsistence Level^{xliv}does not adequately regulate the adjustment of social benefits and the national minimum wage to the minimum subsistence level^{xlv}.

Recommendations:

- ratify the Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
- adjust social benefits and national minimum wage to the minimum subsistence level.

Promoting and Ensuring Human Rights in the Transnistrean Region of Moldova

During the reporting period, the human rights situation in the Transnistrean region has not improved significantly. Poor treatment in places of detention; systemic violations of the rights to education and to property, and freedom of movement are just a few of the issues faced by the persons residing in the region and in the area with an increased security regime xlvi. Although some objectives for promoting and securing human rights in the Transnistrean region were included in the National Human Rights Action Plan for 2011-2014xlvii, many of them have not been achieved.

In October 2012, the Ombudsperson's Institution opened a representative office in the Varnitavillage, situated in the area with increased security regime. The representative office monitors, within available sources, the observance of human rights in the Transnistrean region and contributes to promoting human rights by supporting the activity of NGOs in the region.

Following the war of Transnistria in 1992, around 130 thousand people left the region and were internally displaced. The lack of a law about internally displaced people denies them guarantees for protection and creates a legal vacuum. The existing law ignores internally displaced persons and has no mechanisms for their protection.

Recommendations:

- include the topics of monitoring, promotion and protection of human rights on the negotiations agenda within existing formats;
- create a sectoral human rights working group xlviii;
- actively support civil society efforts in promoting human rights in the Transnistrean region; and
- withdraw reservations about non-observance of international treaties in the Transnistrean region, on signature, acceptance, approval or joining of international treaties.

Decision of the Parliament of Moldova No.90 of 12.05.2011 for approval of the National Human Rights Action Plan for 2011-2014.

ⁱⁱ Law No. 231 of 25.11.2011 for approval of the Justice Sector Reform Strategy for 2011-2016; Parliament Decision No. 6 of 16.02.2012 for approval of the Action Plan for implementation of the Judicial Sector Reform Strategy for 2011-2016.

"Decision of the Constitutional Court No.27 of 13.11.2014, http://constcourt.md/ccdocview.php?tip=hotariri&docid=518&l=ro. The notification regarding the control of the constitutionality of the phrase "submitted by a person declared incapable by a court decision" from Art.21 par.(5) let. e) of the Law on the People's Advocate (Ombudsman) No.52 of April 3, 2014 was sent by the Ombudsperson on June 18, 2014. According to the provision, which was challenged to the Constitutional Court, the Ombudsperson was not able to receive for examination the petitions filed by persons who were declared incapable by a court decision; Decision of the Constitutional Court No. 27 of 13.11.2014, http://constcourt.md/ccdocview.php?tip=hotariri&docid=518&l=ro.

WOpinion No.808/2015 of 25.06.2015 of the European Commission for Democracy through Law (Venice Commission),

http://www.venice.coe.int/webforms/documents/?pdf=CDL-REF(2015)018-e.

*Opinion of the Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law (Directorate of Human Rights) of the Council of Europeon the Law no. 52 of 3 April 2014 on the People's Advocate (Ombudsperson) of Moldova, Chapter V - The National Mechanism for the Prevention of Torture, Ref DGI (2015) 25 of 28 November 2015, http://www.coe.md/images/stories/Articles/CJR-Project/npm_omb_law_md_opinion_ro.pdf

*Report of the Ombudsperson on Human Rights Observance in Moldova in 2015.

viiNational Program on Development of Inclusive Education for 2011-2020; Oder of the Minister of Education (MoE) No.99 of 26.02.2015; Order of the MoE No.100 of 26.02 2015; Order of MoE No.98 of 26.02.2015; Order of the MoE No.156 of 20.03. 2015; Order of MoE No.311 of May 05, 2015

viii http://www.ombudsman.md/sites/default/files/document/attachments/1354_raport-2015_cpdom_small_0.pdf.

ix http://www.ombudsman.md/ro/content/respectarea-drepturilor-copilului-republica-moldova-anul-2015.

*Government Decision No. 784 of 09.07.2007 for approval of the National Strategy and Action Plan on the Reform of the Residential Child Care System for 2007-2012; Government Decision No. 434 of 10.06.2014 for approval of the Strategy for Child Protection for \$2014-2020.

xi http://www.ombudsman.md/sites/default/files/document/attachments/studiu-_protectia_copiilor_in_rm_0.pdf.

xii Law No.75 of April 30, 2015 on Housing.

xiiiLabour Code No.154 of 28.03.2003.

xivNational Action Plan on Preventing and Eliminating the Worst Forms of Child Labour for 2011-2015, approved by Government Decision of October 11, 2011.

xv Art. 165¹, art. 168 of the Criminal Code, art. 55, 55¹, 58 of the Administrative Code, art. 7¹ of the Labour Code.

xvi http://www.ism.gov.md/ro/content/raport-anual-0; http://lex.justice.md/index.php?action=view&view=doc&lang=1&id=359314

xvii Report of the Ombudsperson on Human Rights Observance in Moldova in 2015. http://ombudsman.md/ro/content/respectarea-drepturilor-copilului-republica-moldova-anul-2015.

xviii Joint Order of the Minister of Justice and the Minister of Interior, No. 19/17 of January 26, 2015.

xix United Nations Guidelines for the Prevention of Juvenile Delinquency (The Riyadh Guidelines).

xx Expense Strategy for the Health Sector. 2012-2014, www.minfin.md/common/files/CCTM; National Public Health Strategy for 2014-2020, approved by Government Decision No.1032 of 20.12.2013.

xxi Reports of the Ombudsperson on Human rights Observance in Moldova in 2015, 2014,2013, 2012; www.ombudsman.md

xxiiOpinion of the Head of the National Health Insurance Company expressed within the IInd Edition of the National Health Forum, November 25-26, 2013, Chisinau, www.moldova-suverana.md/article/plile-informale-n-sistemul-de-sntate-se-ridic-la-peste-2-mlrd-de-lei_3872.

xxiii—The international recommended limit is 1,700 m³ as a secure level of availability of annual renewable water supply per person. A volume of available water lower than 1000 m³ per capita yearly may hinder the economic development and affect the health and living standard of the population.

xxiv National Human Development Report 2014. Good Corporate Citizens Public and Private Goals Aligned for Human Development, www.undp.md

xxxLaw No. 231 of 25.11.2011 for approval of the Justice Sector Reform Strategy for 2011-2016; Parliament Decision No. 6 of 16.02.2012 for approval of the Action Plan for implementation of the Judicial Sector Reform Strategy for 2011-2016.

xxviOverall Reports on the Implementation of the SRJS, http://justice.gov.md/tabview.php?l=ro&idc=489.

xxviihttp://www.ipp.md/lib.php?l=ro&idc=156.

xxviiiReport of the Ombudsperson on Human Rights Observance in the Republic of Moldova in 2011, 2012, 2013. 2014,

http://www.ombudsman.md/ro/advanced-page-type/anuale.

xxixECHR decisions on the case of Mitrofan v. the Republic of Moldova No. 50054/07, 15.01.2013; Silvestru v. the Republic of Moldova, No.28173/10, 13.01.2015; Pisaroglu v. the Republic of Moldova, No.21061/11, 03.03.2015, Mescereacov V. the Republic of Moldova, No.61050/11, 16.02.2016.

xxxGovernment Decision No.1624 of 31.12.2003 for approval of the Concept Paper on the Reform of the Penitentiary System and the 2004-2020 Action Plan for implementation of the Concept Paper on the Reform of the Penitentiary System; Parliament Decision No. 6 of 16.02.2012 for approval of the Action Plan for implementation of the Judicial Sector Reform Strategy for 2011-2016. Specific area of intervention 6.4.2. xxxiEnforcement Code of the Republic of Moldova No.443 of 24.12.2004, Status of punishment execution by the convicts, Government Decision No.583 of 26.05.2006.

ECHR Decision in the case of Sisanov v. the Republic of Moldova, No. 11353/06, 15.09.2015.

xxxiiiGovernment Decision No.898 of 30.12.2015, for approval of the Framework Regulation on Organisation and Operation of the Service for Assistance and Protection of Human Trafficking Victims and the Minimal Quality Standards, Official Gazette No. 2-12/5 of 15.01.2016.

xxxivBy Law No.270 of 07.11.2013, for amendment and supplementation of some legal acts, the Criminal Code was amended in art. 158, 165, 168, 206, 220, 302, 316, as well as the Criminal Procedure Code, in art. 90, 110, 215.

xxxxhttp://procuratura.md/file/raport.2014.final1.14.pdf

http://procuratura.md/file/Raport%20PG%202013%20final.pdf

http://procuratura.md/file/RAPORTUL%20PG%20pentru%20a.%202012.pdf

http://procuratura.md/file/RAPORT%202011.pdf

xxxi/ln 2011- 372 crimes; in 2012 – 440 crimes; in 2013 – 269 crimes; in 2014 - 292 crimes.

xxxviiLaw on Social Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities No.60 of 30.03.2012 and the related documents for enforcement of the law and for creating social community services.

xxxviiiiReports of the Ombudsperson on the Human rights Observance in Moldova in 2013, 2014, 2015,

http://www.ombudsman.md/ro/advanced-page-type/anuale

xxxix(2013-76.1%; 2014-78%; 2015-81.1%)

xl National Social Insurance House http://www.cnas.md/lib.php?l=ro&idc=244&nod=1&

Reports of the Ombudsperson on the Human rights Observance in Moldova in 2013, 2014, 2015

xliiGovernment Decision No.550 of 09.07.2014 on Establishment of the Size of the National Minimum Wage.

xliiiGovernment Decision No.285 of 30.04.2013 for approval of the Regulation on Calculation of the Size of the Minimal Subsistence Level. (years 2009-2014 - 600 MDL (27 EUR), since 2014 - 1000 MDL (45 EUR))

 $^{^{\}mbox{\tiny xliv}}$ Law No.152 of 05.07.2012 on the Minimal Subsistence Level

xlvReports on Human Rights Observance in Moldova for 2012, 2013

xivi Annual report of the Ombudsperson on Human Rights Observance in the Republic of Moldova, http://ombudsman.md/en/advanced-page-type/anuale; reports of Promo-LEX association on the observance of human rights in the Transnistrean region of Moldova, https://promolex.md/index.php?module=publications; Report on Human Rights in the Transnistrian Region of the Republic of Moldova, by Thomas Hammarberg, February 2013, file:///C:/Users/CPDOM/Downloads/Senior_Expert_Hammarberg_Report_TN_Human_Rights%20(1).pdf xiviiParliament Decision No.90 of 12.05.2011 for approval of the Human Rights Action Plan for 2011-2014.

xiviii By Government Decision No.1178 of 31.10.2007 for enforcement of the initiatives of the President of Moldova on increasing the confidence and security in the context of settlement of the Transnistrean issue, the list of sectoral working groups and the membership thereofwas approved: working group for economy and trade, working group for infrastructure development; working group for ensuring proper operation of the railway, working group for health protection and social issues, working group for education and science, working group for demilitarisation and security strengthening, working group for humanitarian aid, working group for agriculture. The working groups created in Chisinau and Tiraspol aim at implementing jointly specific projects in the social and economic, humanitarian and security areas, including with the support of international partners, as well as at contributing to supporting the population and creating conditions proper for conducting negotiations for the political regulation of the conflict. The Ombudsman recommends creating a sectoral human rights working group starting in 2013 (http://ombudsman.md/ro/advanced-page-type/anuale).