# Syria Mid-term Implementation Assessment







# Introduction

#### 1. Purpose of the follow-up programme

The second and subsequent cycles of the review should focus on, inter alia, the implementation of the accepted recommendations and the development of the human rights situation in the State under review.

A/HRC/RES/16/21, 12 April 2011 (Annex I C § 6)

The Universal Periodic Review (UPR) process takes place every four and one half years; however, some recommendations can be implemented immediately. In order to reduce this interval, we have created a follow-up process to evaluate the human rights situation two years after the examination at the UPR.

Broadly speaking, *UPR Info* seeks to ensure the respect of commitments made in the UPR, but also, more specifically, to give stakeholders the opportunity to share their opinion on the commitments. To this end, about two years after the review, *UPR Info* invites States, NGOs, and National Institutions for Human Rights (NHRI) to share their comments on the implementation (or lack thereof) of recommendations adopted at the Human Rights Council (HRC) plenary session.

For this purpose, *UPR Info* publishes a Mid-term Implementation Assessment (MIA) including responses from each stakeholder. The MIA is meant to show how all stakeholders are disposed to follow through on and to implement their commitments. States should implement the recommendations that they have accepted and civil society should monitor that implementation.

While the follow-up's importance has been highlighted by the HRC, no precise directives regarding the follow-up procedure have been set until now. Therefore, *UPR Info* is willing to share good practices as soon as possible and to strengthen the collaboration pattern between States and stakeholders. Unless the UPR's follow-up is seriously considered, the UPR mechanism as a whole could be adversely affected.

The methodology used by UPR Info to collect data and to calculate the index is described at the end of this document.

Geneva, 15 August 2014





# **Follow-up Outcomes**

All data are available at the following address:

http://followup.upr-info.org/index/country/syria

We invite the reader to consult this webpage since all recommendations, all stakeholders' reports, as well as the unedited comments can be found at the same internet address.

24 stakeholders' reports were submitted for the UPR. 20 NGOs were contacted. 3 UN agencies were contacted. The Permanent Mission to the UN was contacted. A National Human Rights Institution (NHRI) does not exist.

8 NGOs responded to our enquiry. None of the UN agencies responded. The State under Review did not respond to our enquiry.

The following stakeholders took part in the report:

 NGOs: (1) Alkarama Foundation (Alkarama) (2) Arab NGO Network for Development + Syrian Center for Policy Research (ANND+SCPR) (3) Damascus Centre for Human Rights Studies (DCHRS) (4) Habitat International Coalition (HIC) (5) International Support Kurds in Syria Association (SKS) (6) Karama (KARAMA) (7) Unrepresented Nations and Peoples Organization (UNPO)

*IRI*: 152 recommendations are not implemented, 7 recommendations are partially implemented, and 0 recommendations are fully implemented. No answer was received for 23 out of 182 recommendations and voluntary pledges (full list of unanswered recommendations is available at the end of this document).



# 2. Index

Hereby the issues that the MIA covers:

rec. n°	Rec. State	Issue	IRI	page
50	Algeria	Asylum-seekers - refugees	not impl.	page 28
60	Algeria	Development	not impl.	page 26
141	Australia	Freedom of association and peaceful assembly	not impl.	page 16
142	Australia	Freedom of association and peaceful assembly	not impl.	page 16
147	Australia	Technical assistance	not impl.	page 72
156	Australia	Freedom of the press, Technical assistance	not impl.	page 17
161	Australia	General	not impl.	page 73
5	Bangladesh	Special procedures, UPR process	not impl.	page 34
35	Bangladesh	Women's rights	not impl.	page 60
41	Bangladesh	Rights of the Child	not impl.	page 60
11	Belarus	General	not impl.	page 64
38	Belarus	Rights of the Child, Trafficking, Women's rights	not impl.	page 60
61	Belgium	Freedom of religion and belief,International instruments	not impl.	page 36
63	Belgium	International instruments	not impl.	page 36
80	Belgium	International instruments, Justice	not impl.	page 50
88	Belgium	Torture and other CID treatment, Treaty bodies	not impl.	page 37
127	Belgium	Human rights defenders, Special procedures, Torture and other CID treatment	not impl.	page 55
9	Bolivia	NHRI	not impl.	page 64
20	Bolivia	Civil society	not impl.	page 11
53	Bolivia	Right to food	not impl.	page 24
56	Bolivia	Right to education	not impl.	page 25
57	Bolivia	Right to health, Rights of the Child, Women's rights	not impl.	page 25
170	Bolivia	Enforced disappearances, Justice	not impl.	page 57
82	Brazil	Freedom of association and peaceful assembly,Freedom of opinion and expression,Freedom of the press	not impl.	page 14
100	Brazil	Women's rights	partially impl.	page 61
107	Brazil	International instruments, Torture and other CID treatment	not impl.	page 55
114	Brazil	Other	not impl.	page 71
130	Brazil	International instruments, Justice	not impl.	page 42
167	Brazil	Special procedures	not impl.	page 43
136	Canada	Rights of the Child, Women's rights	not impl.	page 62
146	Canada	Freedom of association and peaceful assembly,Freedom of religion and belief	not impl.	page 16
152	Canada	General	not impl.	page 54
153	Canada	Technical assistance	not impl.	page 72
160	Canada	Justice	not impl.	page 57
163	Canada	ESC rights - general, Minorities	not impl.	page 32
67	Chile	Rights of the Child	not impl.	page 61
76	Chile	Freedom of opinion and expression	not impl.	page 49
119	Chile	Other	not impl.	page 71



rec. n°	Rec. State	Issue	IRI	page
12	Cuba	Other	not impl.	page 65
13	Cuba	General	partially impl.	page 65
149	Czech Republic	Human rights violations by state agents	not impl.	page 56
178	Czech Republic	Detention conditions, Enforced disappearances	not impl.	page 57
52	DPR Korea	Right to education, Right to health	not impl.	page 23
16	Ecuador	General	not impl.	page 65
58	Ecuador	Asylum-seekers - refugees	not impl.	page 30
140	France	Justice	not impl.	page 56
150	France	Technical assistance	not impl.	page 72
158	France	Freedom of the press	not impl.	page 18
122	Germany	Technical assistance	not impl.	page 72
123	Guatemala	Special procedures	not impl.	page 41
1	Indonesia	International instruments	not impl.	page 33
7	Indonesia	NHRI	not impl.	page 64
18	Indonesia	Civil society	not impl.	page 10
31	Indonesia	National plan of action, Rights of the Child, Women's rights	not impl.	page 59
17	Iran	General	not impl.	page 66
34	Iran	International instruments, Treaty bodies	not impl.	page 35
46	Iran	Development	not impl.	page 22
166	Ireland	Freedom of association and peaceful assembly, Special procedures	not impl.	page 43
81	Japan	Freedom of association and peaceful assembly,Freedom of opinion and expression	not impl.	page 13
102	Japan	Enforced disappearances,International instruments	not impl.	page 38
165	Japan	Special procedures	not impl.	page 44
172	Japan	Extrajudicial executions, Public security, Rights of the Child, Women's rights	not impl.	page 58
47	Lebanon	Development	not impl.	page 22
48	Lebanon	ESC rights - general	not impl.	page 22
6	Malaysia	Special procedures,Treaty bodies,UPR process	not impl.	page 35
26	Malaysia	Other	not impl.	page 68
40	Malaysia	Justice	not impl.	page 44
2	Maldives	CP rights - general, International instruments, Rights of the Child, Torture and other CID treatment, Women's rights	not impl.	page 34
14	Maldives	Elections	not impl.	page 9
105	Maldives	Detention conditions,International instruments,Torture and other CID treatment	not impl.	page 39
120	Maldives	Technical assistance	not impl.	page 71
68	Mexico	Minorities,Racial discrimination	not impl.	page 31
108	Mexico	International instruments, Torture and other CID treatment	not impl.	page 55
111	Mexico	Detention conditions,International instruments,Torture and other CID treatment Minorities,Right to health,Rights of the Child,Women's	not impl.	page 40
54	Myanmar	rights	not impl.	page 20
43	Netherlands	Freedom of association and peaceful assembly, Freedom of opinion and expression	not impl.	page 12
97	Netherlands	Public security	not impl.	page 54
98	Netherlands	Human rights violations by state agents, Justice, Impunity	not impl.	page 44
29	Nicaragua	Poverty	not impl.	page 20



rec. n°	Rec. State	Issue	IRI	page
71	Norway	Detention conditions	not impl.	page 47
89	Norway	Torture and other CID treatment	not impl.	page 51
118	Norway	Technical assistance	not impl.	page 71
154	Norway	Other	not impl.	page 73
173	Norway	Freedom of association and peaceful assembly, Human rights defenders	not impl.	page 18
180	Norway	Freedom of association and peaceful assembly, Human rights defenders, International instruments	not impl.	page 58
103	Peru	Asylum-seekers - refugees,International instruments	not impl.	page 39
104	Peru	Detention conditions, Enforced disappearances, International instruments, Torture and other CID treatment	not impl.	page 39
106	Peru	International instruments	not impl.	page 54
124	Peru	Other	not impl.	page 72
8	Poland	NHRI	not impl.	page 64
59	Poland	Civil society,UPR process	not impl.	page 35
65	Poland	Right to health	not impl.	page 26
72	Poland	Detention conditions,Freedom of religion and belief	not impl.	page 47
78	Poland	Detention conditions	not impl.	page 49
83	Poland	Freedom of opinion and expression, Freedom of the press	not impl.	page 14
86	Poland	Freedom of association and peaceful assembly	not impl.	page 15
87	Poland	International instruments, Rights of the Child, Torture and other CID treatment, Women's rights	not impl.	page 37
96	Poland	Freedom of association and peaceful assembly	not impl.	page 15
101	Poland	General	not impl.	page 70
129	Poland	International instruments, Justice	not impl.	page 42
94	Republic of Korea	General	not impl.	page 52
121	Republic of Korea	Special procedures, Technical assistance, Treaty bodies, UPR process	not impl.	page 71
33	Russian Federation	Right to education, Right to health	not impl.	page 20
39	Russian Federation	Extrajudicial executions	not impl.	page 44
42	Russian Federation	Freedom of opinion and expression	not impl.	page 11
44	Russian Federation	Freedom of association and peaceful assembly	not impl.	page 13
66	Slovenia	Women's rights	not impl.	page 61
115	Slovenia	Technical assistance	partially impl.	page 71
126	Slovenia	Special procedures	not impl.	page 41
131	Slovenia	International instruments, Justice	not impl.	page 42
179	Slovenia	Human rights defenders	not impl.	page 58
19	South Africa	General	not impl.	page 66
92	South Africa	General	not impl.	page 52
15	Spain	Elections	not impl.	page 10
70	Spain	Detention conditions,Freedom of religion and belief,Torture and other CID treatment	not impl.	page 46
77	Spain	Detention conditions, Enforced disappearances	not impl.	page 49
95	Spain	Justice	not impl.	page 53





Spain Extrajudicial executions, Freedom of association and peaceful assembly, Rights of the Child not impl.  Sudan General not impl. peaceful assembly, Rights of the Child not impl. peaceful assembly, International instruments not impl.	page 44 page 18 page 68 page 36 page 45 page 48 page 72 page 18 page 48 page 50
peaceful assembly,Rights of the Child  Sudan General not impl. p  Sweden Freedom of association and peaceful assembly,International instruments not impl. p  Sweden Torture and other CID treatment not impl. p  Sweden Detention conditions,Freedom of opinion and expression,Human rights defenders not impl. p	page 68 page 36 page 45 page 48 page 72 page 18
Freedom of association and peaceful assembly, International instruments not impl.  Sweden Torture and other CID treatment not impl.  Sweden Detention conditions, Freedom of opinion and expression, Human rights defenders not impl.	page 36 page 45 page 48 page 72 page 18 page 48
assembly,International instruments not impl. p  Sweden Torture and other CID treatment not impl. p  Sweden Detention conditions,Freedom of opinion and expression,Human rights defenders not impl. p	page 45 page 48 page 72 page 18 page 48
75 Sweden Detention conditions,Freedom of opinion and expression,Human rights defenders not impl.	page 48 page 72 page 18 page 48
expression, Human rights defenders	page 72 page 18 page 48
149 Swedon Tochnical assistance sortially imply a	page 18
148 Sweden Technical assistance partially impl. p	page 48
Extrajudicial executions,Freedom of opinion and 174 Sweden expression,Human rights violations by state not impl. p agents,International instruments	_
73 Switzerland Detention conditions,Freedom of religion and belief not impl. p	page 50
79 Switzerland Justice not impl. p	
93 Switzerland Extrajudicial executions, Torture and other CID treatment not impl. p	page 51
99 Switzerland Freedom of opinion and expression not impl. p	page 13
112 Switzerland International instruments, Torture and other CID treatment not impl. p	page 40
116 Switzerland Technical assistance partially impl. p	page 71
157 Switzerland Freedom of the press not impl. p	page 18
164 Switzerland Special procedures not impl. p	page 43
	page 73
	page 74
	page 68
	page 69
	page 29
	page 51
bodies, of it process	page 71
- Or Opinion and expression	page 14
association and peaceful assembly	page 52
113 United Kingdom Other not impl. p	page 70
	page 31
	page 16
	page 16
	page 17
	page 63
	page 60
·	page 48
	page 40
	page 56
	page 43
Child, Franticking, Worner's rights	page 58
45 Venezuela Freedom of association and peaceful assembly, Public not impl. p	page 13
·	page 20
	page 67





rec. n°	Rec. State	Issue	IRI	page
24	Viet Nam	Development	not impl.	page 19
30	Viet Nam	Rights of the Child, Women's rights	not impl.	page 59



#### 3. Feedback on recommendations

# **CP Rights**

Recommendation nº14: Establish an inclusive national dialogue leading to free and fair multiparty elections as soon as possible (Recommended by Maldives)

IRI: not implemented

# Alkarama Foundation (Alkarama) response:

Not implemented: The Syrian government has taken a new election law in March 2014 that de facto excluded numerous opponents to run for presidential elections. Indeed, the new law states that any candidate has to have maintained a continuous residence in Syria for the past ten years while most of the opponents are in exile at the moment. This amendment contradicts the Syrian Constitution itself as it creates a difference in treatment between citizens which is forbidden by article 33. Moreover, the legislation set further conditions that required candidates to hold Syrian citizenship only, to be a child of Syrian citizens and married only to a Syrian citizen, and to be free of criminal convictions. This last condition, even if it is justifiable, jeopardized the possibility for opponents to run for elections as the regime had or would have charged them under criminal or terrorism charges. At least, the new Constitution adopted in 2012 removed article 8 of the Syrian Constitution that established the Baath party "as the leading party in the society" and introduced the possibility of multiparty elections. Presidential elections were planned on 3 June 2014 with 3 candidates, including the current president, Bashar Al Assad. 21 other candidates were not allowed to run for the elections as they did not fit the criteria set up by the new law. Bashar Al Assad was re-elected on 5 June 2014.

# Damascus Centre for Human Rights Studies response:

Not implemented. Free and fair political activity is not permitted by the Syrian government.

# International Support Kurds in Syria Association (SKS) response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation. The coming election has a very restricted list of candidates that prevents true multiparty elections. The decision to place restrictions on those who could stand for election and those who could vote effectively ruled out much of the opposition. Many are in detention. Those standing for election had to be





recommended by 35 existing members of Parliament which opened the way only to those in favour of the current Parliament - and excluded real opposition figures.

Recommendation nº15: Make effective a genuine process of national dialogue with the opposition (Recommended by Spain)

IRI: not implemented

# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented. Members of the opposition are branded as traitors, banned from participating in the minimal political activities occurring, and would be arrested on sight.

# Alkarama response:

Not implemented: If some talks have been held in Geneva in view of finding a solution to the Syrian crisis, the authorities have not facilitated the dialogue. They notably recently added some of the opposition delegates on Syria's terrorists list.

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation. The regime has continued to press its own agenda without entering into real dialogue. There have been times when al-Assad appeared to be conciliatory but mostly it was later shown to be a time-wasting exercise because even at Geneva they were not serious in their intention to negotiate.

Recommendation nº18: Continue efforts to find peaceful solutions to any issues pertaining to the protection of human rights in the country, including through inclusive dialogues involving relevant civil societies (Recommended by Indonesia)

IRI: not implemented

# DCHRS response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

# <u>Unrepresented Nations and Peoples Organization (UNPO) response:</u>

In March 2011, a series of protests started taking place in Syria seeking political and economic reforms within the framework of the existing government. The violent crackdown of Assad's regime caused an escalation in the conflict with an armed rebellion seeking to overthrow Bashar al-Assad and his family. This has led to a full-fledged civil war in





which more than 3 million people have fled Syria and in excess of 2.5 million of them have registered as refugees; 6.5 million are displaced within Syria; 3 million Syrians need assistance within the country; 200,000 live in areas besieged by Syrian government forces and 40,000 in areas surrounded by opposition fighters. The few concessions and promised reforms by President Assad have proven insufficient and lost all credibility by brutalities perpetuated by security forces. Government forces and progovernment militia commit prevalent attacks on civilians, systematically committing murder, torture, rape and enforced disappearance. Assad's regime and its supporters have committed gross violations of human rights, crimes against humanity and numerous war crimes. The attacks were unjustified and of disproportionate force, causing indiscriminate and suffering amongst civilians arbitrary and perpetrating Government forces continue to unlawfully kill those perceived as potential enemies. A peaceful resolution to the conflict is not possible without the implementation of a reform process that takes into account the aspirations of the Syrian people and that introduces human rights as the core in all policies and reforms.

Recommendation nº20: Continue to appropriately implement all changes promised to its people and strengthen the dialogue mechanisms with civil society (Recommended by Bolivia)

IRI: not implemented

# Alkarama response:

Not implemented: It is extremely difficult for organizations to be registered in Syria and therefore to be able to raise their concerns and voices. Indeed, the law concerning associations authorizes the security forces to refuse such a registration under any motives. Such possibility has been widely used since March 2011.

# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

# <u>UNPO response:</u>

[See response to recommendation n°18]

Recommendation nº42: Ensure freedom of expression in conformity with the principles of the Constitution and adopt additional measures to put this in practice (Recommended by Russian Federation)

IRI: not implemented

# <u>Alkarama response:</u>

Not implemented: For instance, the decision on March 24 2014 to prosecute Mazen Darwish, head of the Syrian Centre for Media and





Freedom of Expression and two of his colleagues by the Damascus Anti-Terrorism Court, for allegedly "publicising terrorists acts" clearly shows that freedom of expression in Syria is not guaranteed and violated by authorities on a daily-basis. UNESCO itself had called the Syrian government to cease its attacks against media and journalists, in June 2011. It has been reported that more than 150 news providers have been killed since March 2011. The legislative decree No. 108 of 2011 tightened the right to freedom of expression as it put media regulation in the direct control of the Syrian cabinet (the National Council on Information is in charge of checking if information are "objective" or not and if the journalist acted "responsibly"). The vague wording of this decree also authorises authorities to easily prosecute journalists.

# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

#### SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation. Any opposition is targeted such as Abdul Aziz al-Khayer, Rajar al-Nasar, Iyas Ayash, Maher Tahan who are leaders from the National Democratic Body for Democratic Change in Syria - NCB, who al-Assad denies holding; and journalists who have been targeted.

Recommendation nº43: Implement the right to life, freedom of expression and opinion and the freedom of assembly in day-to-day practice (Recommended by Netherlands)

IRI: not implemented

# Alkarama response:

Not implemented: Our organization has submitted several cases to the UN Special Procedures, including the SR on the right to peaceful assembly and of association, concerning peaceful political opponents that had been arrested for exercising their rights. The Legislative Decree No. 54 Regulating Right to Peaceful Demonstration, adopted on 21 April 2011 is notably used by the authorities to break down any person who demonstrates and uses of his rights to peaceful assembly. This decree defines as a "riot" any unauthorized gathering and punishes it with one year of imprisonment. Finally, the withdrawal of the law establishing the state of emergency that was widely criticized for violating freedom of expression and of peaceful assembly did not lead to real improvements, even if this withdrawal was at first, a positive step.

# <u>DCHRS response:</u> Not implemented





Recommendation nº44: Adopt measures to ensure the rights of citizens to peaceful assembly under conditions of observance of public order and the safety of citizens and state and private establishments and organizations (Recommended by Russian Federation)

IRI: not implemented

#### Alkarama response:

[See response to recommendation n°43]

# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº45: Continue efforts to create an environment harmonizing citizens' rights to peaceful protest with the need for security and integrity of the country and with efforts to maintain public order and protect public and private property (Recommended by Venezuela)

IRI: not implemented

# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº81: Take steps to ensure that the freedoms of expression and association are fully respected as called for by the 16th Special Session of the Human Rights Council (Recommended by Japan)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº99: Take all measures to respect freedom of expression (Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: not implemented

# Alkarama response:

Not implemented: For instance, the decision on March 24 2014 to prosecute Mazen Darwish, head of the Syrian Centre for Media and Freedom of Expression and two of his colleagues by the Damascus Anti-Terrorism Court, for allegedly "publicising terrorists acts" clearly shows that freedom of expression in Syria is not guaranteed and violated by authorities on a daily-basis. Though, it was reported that Mr Darwish could be released after the general amnesty granted by al Assad in June 2014. UNESCO itself had called the Syrian government to cease its attacks against media





and journalists, in June 2011. It has been reported that more than 150 news providers have been killed since March 2011. The legislative decree No. 108 of 2011 tightened the right to freedom of expression as it put media regulation in the direct control of the Syrian cabinet (the National Council on Information is in charge of checking if information are "objective" or not and if the journalist acted "responsibly"). The vague wording of this decree also authorises authorities to easily prosecute journalists.

# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº82: Fully respect freedom of expression and association, and allow for unhindered activities by media (Recommended by Brazil)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº84: Immediately end all human rights violations against civilians in relation to their peaceful exercise of freedom of expression and assembly (Recommended by United Kingdom)

IRI: not implemented

# Alkarama response:

Not implemented: Concerning freedom of media, the 2001 Press Law allows for a broad State control of newspapers and other channels of information. Thus, all information that is seen as harming national interests/security can be forbidden and their authors prosecuted. Moreover, foreign information has to be government approved before being released in the country.

# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº83: Put an end to direct and indirect restrictions on freedom of expression and adopt appropriate measures, including legislative measures, to prevent any intimidation of journalists (Recommended by Poland)

IRI: not implemented





#### Alkarama response:

[See response to recommendation n°82]

# DCHRS response:

Not implemented

#### SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation. Journalists have been targeted by the regime.

Recommendation nº86: Enable civil society to meet peacefully and organise in freedom and safety (Recommended by Poland)

IRI: not implemented

# Alkarama response:

Not implemented: It is extremely difficult for organizations/associations to be registered in Syria and therefore to be able to raise their concerns and voices. Indeed, the law concerning associations authorizes the security forces to refuse such a registration under any motives. Such possibility has been widely used since March 2011.

#### **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

#### SKS response:

[...]

Recommendation nº96: Launch a credible and impartial investigation and prosecute those responsible for attacks on peaceful protesters (Recommended by Poland)

IRI: not implemented

#### Alkarama response:

Not implemented: In its last report to the Human Rights Council, the Independent International Commission of Inquiry on Syria emphasized on impunity for perpetrators of gross violations of human rights in Syria. The lack of independence of the judiciary also prohibits a real accountability for the few who are effectively prosecuted.

#### DCHRS response:

Not implemented

#### SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.





Recommendation nº139: Immediately end violations of international human rights law, including violent reprisals against peaceful protestors, political activists and their families (Recommended by United States)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº141: Immediately end attacks on peaceful protesters and activists and bring violators to account (Recommended by Australia)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº143: *Immediately and unconditionally release all prisoners of conscience* (Recommended by *United States*)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº146: Immediately release all prisoners of conscience, including all persons detained for participating in peaceful demonstrations since March 2011 (Recommended by Canada)

IRI: not implemented

# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº142: End its practice of arbitrarily detaining Syrians for participating in peaceful demonstrations and release all those held in detention (Recommended by Australia)

IRI: not implemented

# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

# **UNPO** response:

Tens of thousands of people have been arbitrarily arrested since the conflict began. The government has jailed civilians including peaceful protestors, civil society and political activists, aid workers and journalists, physicians and lawyers without sparing women, children, and people with disabilities and serious medical conditions, often leading to other human rights violations like torture or unlawful killings. Civilians are detained without a legal basis, their detention is not justified on permissible grounds and they are systematically presented before jurisdictions that fail to comply with the most basic guarantees for the respect of principles of fair trial. Detainees in





governmental detention facilities are subjected on a daily basis to the most severe human rights violations including the widespread and systematic use of torture. They are also typically held for days outside the law amounting to enforced disappearance. The judiciary system fails to comply with both international standards and the Syrian Constitution and its domestic regulations. The Government should be held responsible for the protection of the rights of its citizens and has the responsibility of bringing perpetrators of violations to justice. Instead, there is no sign of willingness or ability to control its security and intelligence apparatus and has excused pro-government forces perpetrating crimes. There are no independent monitoring and investigating mechanisms in Syria and the national mechanisms are neither effective nor just.

Recommendation nº155: Expeditiously permit international humanitarian missions, human rights observers and media unrestricted access within Syria, including the HRC Commission of Inquiry (Recommended by United States)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº156: Allow unrestricted access to journalists, humanitarian workers and the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (Recommended by Australia)

IRI: not implemented

# Alkarama response:

Not implemented: Several reports have shown that the regime and the rebels as well, have blocked humanitarian relief not later than March 2014. For instance, the Red Crescent/Cross was denied access by the army to Aleppo central prison even though this humanitarian aid sometimes represents the only assistance the population has. Moreover, the situation of humanitarian workers is very difficult. In 2013, seven members of the Red Cross have been abducted. The Red Cross made a call for the authorities and the rebels to allow them to work in line with the Red Cross's values and mandate. The UN Secretary General recently (March 2014) recognized that both sides of the Syrian conflict were impeding humanitarian work. Our organization also sent several communications to the UN Special Procedures concerning Syrian humanitarian relief workers that had been targeted by the regime because of their humanitarian activities. The authorities have denied humanitarian organizations to deliver medicines and supplies in several cities of Syria.

# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented





# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº157: Allow the access of international media, independent media and diplomats (Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: not implemented

# DCHRS response:

Not implemented fully.

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº158: Allow journalists to freely exercise their profession and grant international media access to its territory (Recommended by France)

IRI: not implemented

# Alkarama response:

Not implemented: The authorities have threatened international media of being allied to rebels and terrorists and said they entered illegally the Syrian territory. Therefore, the government has largely banned foreign media to work in Syria.

# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº173: Immediately end the violence against peaceful protesters, including human rights defenders, and hold accountable those responsible for such acts (Recommended by Norway)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº174: Put an immediate stop to the excessive and lethal use of force against demonstrators and the killing of protesters, in respect of its international human rights obligations (Recommended by Sweden)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº175: Immediately put an end to repressions of peaceful protests that have led to a high number of deaths and wounded people, including children (Recommended by Spain)

IRI: not implemented





# DCHRS response: Not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

# **ESC Rights**

Recommendation n°24: Implement political and economic reforms conducted with the full participation of all social sectors for the development of the country and better ensure the fundamental rights and freedom for the people (Recommended by Viet Nam)

IRI: not implemented

# DCHRS response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

# **UNPO** response:

In March 2011 a series of protests started taking place in Syria seeking political and economic reforms within the framework of the existing government. The violent crackdown of Assad's regime caused an escalation in the conflict with an armed rebellion seeking to overthrow Bashar al-Assad and his family. This has led to a full-fledged civil war in which more than 3 million people have fled Syria and in excess of 2.5 million of them have registered as refugees; 6.5 million are displaced within Syria; 3 million Syrians need assistance within the country; 200,000 live in areas besieged by Syrian government forces and 40,000 in areas surrounded by opposition fighters. The few concessions and promised reforms by President Assad have proven insufficient and lost all credibility by brutalities perpetuated by security forces. Government forces and progovernment militia commit prevalent attacks on civilians, systematically committing murder, torture, rape and enforced disappearance. Assad's regime and its supporters have committed gross violations of human rights, crimes against humanity and numerous war crimes. The attacks were unjustified and of disproportionate force, causing indiscriminate and suffering amongst civilians arbitrary and perpetrating Government forces continue to unlawfully kill those perceived as potential enemies. A peaceful resolution to the conflict is not possible without the



implementation of a reform process that takes into account the aspirations of the Syrian people and that introduces human rights as the core in all policies and reforms.

Recommendation nº29: Multiply its efforts to involve in the decision-making the active participation of different social structures, especially those geared to combat poverty and social equality (Recommended by Nicaragua)

IRI: not implemented

# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº33: Further pursue policies and programmes which aim to improve the quality of social services, including health services and education (Recommended by Russian Federation)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº49: Continue improving the quality of public education with the aim of maintaining the excellent level of education by which the different stages of education have been (Recommended by Venezuela)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº54: Continue to provide basic healthcare service for people living in rural areas and increase its focus on vulnerable groups such as women, children and minorities (Recommended by Myanmar)

IRI: not implemented

# DCHRS response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

# <u>Arab NGO Network for Development + Syrian Center for Policy Research</u> (ANND+SCPR) response:

None of the Working Group members participating in the revision session could have expected that the worsening situation in the country and its devastating impacts on the right to education. Whereas their recommendations only mention "continuation" of policies implemented, since 2011 the combined impact of the armed- conflict and economic degeneration unsettled the education system and endangered its role as a main conduit to prepare and develop human capital in Syria.





# Accordingly:

- By December 2013, the Ministry of Education announced that 4,000 schools were out of service due to direct damage or were being used to shelter IDPs. Most damaged schools were located in conflict areas such as Aleppo and Idlib, whereas there was only minor damage to educational infrastructure in relatively safer districts such as Sweyda and Tartous.
- With hundreds of thousands of children no longer attending or unable to access school, the future life chances of the young generation are in jeopardy. By the end of 2013, the non-attendance rate of school-age children was 51.8 per cent. This was up on the 49 per cent of children who were absent during the 2012-2013 school year. Thus, more than half of school-age children were no longer attending school.
- In the international context, the comparison of the net enrolment rate of primary education between Syria and other countries showed that Syria ranked number 21 in 2010 out of 136 countries. (WDI, 2013) But based on current enrolment, using the 2010 data, it is estimated that Syria has fallen to the bottom of the ranking in the 135th position, i.e. the second worst performance in the world.
- There is inequality across the country. In the second half of 2013, school-age nonattendance rate was highest in Al-Raqqa and Aleppo where 94 per cent and 90 per cent, respectively, of school-age children did not attend school. During this period there was reduced school attendance in Rural Damascus and Homs governorates where non-attendance increased from 37 per cent and 28 per cent in 2013-Q2 to 68 per cent and 45 per cent at the end of 2013, respectively.
- While school non-attendance is not as dramatic in the relatively safer areas of the country, poverty, displacement and deteriorating living conditions forced many children to drop out of school in order to decrease the financial burden on their families.
- The quality of education has deteriorated and is constantly compromised even in the safest areas. An increasing number of schools have introduced a two-shift system to manage classroom density as large numbers of new students have moved into safer areas from conflict zones. This has led to fewer hours of education and more crowded classrooms.
- The quality of education was affected by the loss of human resources with teacher shortages due to emigration, refugee flight and displacement. This has put pressure on the capacity of the educational system to maintain good educational outcomes under extremely stressful environmental conditions. Almost 500 educational workers were



killed in 2013 according to the Ministry of Education, while many more have been injured, kidnapped or arrested.

Recommendation nº46: Intensify youth programs and create more employment opportunities for young people (Recommended by Iran)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº47: Intensify youth programs and create more employment opportunities for youths (Recommended by Lebanon)

IRI: not implemented

# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

Recommendation nº48: Further pursue the policies and programs to improve quality and effectiveness of basic social services provided to its citizens (Recommended by Lebanon)

IRI: not implemented

# DCHRS response:

Not implemented

# <u>Habitat International Coalition (HIC) response:</u>

The facilities GDP contracted by 29.6 per cent in 2013-Q3 and by 27.6 per cent in 2013-Q4, and affects the living standards of households forcing many to do without essential services for a long period.

The Syrian conflict damaged 10% of the infrastructure, and affected the right of the Syrian in the damaged areas to access to the basic social services; the government has failed to address the exclusion and marginalization in development the administration and services system. The indicators of the limited economic did not reflect a real significant development, while the economic growth has confined to a limited areas in the big cities.

The institutional bottlenecks has marginalized large segments of society, and deprived them from effective participation in economic, social aspects. This has lead to failure in meeting the need of majority of the Syrians in enhancing and promotes the social justice in developing the social services in health and education as well as, the basic facilities. The number of the poors increased and reached to 3.1 million persons, 1.5 million have fallen below the lower poverty line and becoming extremely poor.

The damaging of basic infrastructure has lead to the outage of the drinking water, electricity, and communication in the areas of the conflict, and the





state failed to provide these facilities because of the lack of coordination with the municipalities, which left a lot of displaced and refugees without water or electricity for months and created a humanitarian disaster for more than 10.8 million Syrian.

In 2011, the government adopted the new decree No.107 about local administration, in spite the new law has provide some full competence for planning, development, and coordinating between the government organs in its region; the new law undermined the independence of the local governance by allowed to the central government to control the councils of the municipalities by making the governors are representative for the central executive authorities, and left the financial administration in the power of the financial ministry.

#### SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

#### ANND+SCPR response:

[See response to recommendation n°33]

Recommendation nº52: Continue policies and programs to improve the quality of basic social services provided to citizens, such as health care and education (Recommended by DPR Korea)

IRI: not implemented

### DCHRS response:

Not implemented

#### SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

# ANND+SCPR response:

[See response to recommendation n°33]

+

Whereas in 2011 revision, the achievements of health sector was applauded the armed conflict has damaged the national healthcare system through damage and destruction to medical facilities and the healthcare infrastructure, the flight of healthcare professionals, death and injury of healthcare staff and the collapse of the pharmaceutical industry.

Moreover, human displacement, the destruction of habitat, the absence of basic needs and lack of access to clean water, or even the fear and anxiety of such privation, are all undermining the health and wellbeing of ordinary Syrians during the current conflict.





- The public health system is in a state of collapse in many areas of Syria, creating enormous burdens on existing facilities, while private and civil society facilities have capacity limitations. By 2013 fourth quarter, 61 of the 91 public hospitals across the country were damaged, with 41 of them (45 per cent) out of service, while 53 private hospitals have also been affected.
- The conflict rendered high health costs on the population requiring medical services from a health system in a state of collapse, with women and children, the sick and the injured especially at risk.
- The health of ordinary Syrians has also been compounded by scarcity and availability of pharmaceutical products, with growing disparities among different regions as cancer drugs and medicines for chronic diseases are reportedly unavailable in many areas of the country, including Dara'a, Rural Damascus, Homs, Hama, Aleppo, Idlib, Deir Ezzor, Al-Raqqa, and Hassaka.

Recommendation nº53: Continue the efforts to strengthen food security for all its people, particularly in rural areas (Recommended by Bolivia)

IRI: not implemented

# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

# HIC response:

The ongoing civil war in Syria continues to affect the food security, the Government sieges have left Syrians in rebel-controlled area starving.

World Food Program is appealing for close to US\$2 billion to assist over 7 million Syrians in urgent need of food assistance this year. The program delivered rations to a record 3.8 million people in Syria in December 2013, but civilians in eastern provinces and besieged towns near the capital remain out of reach.

In March 2014, the United Nations World Food Programme that a potential drought in the area could significantly hurt food production in Syria.

UN Special Rapporteur on the right to safe drinking water and sanitation has warned "Depriving people of their right to access safe water, not only denies them a basic and fundamental human right, but also an essential element to support life and health". And asserted that that some armed opposition groups and the Government of Syria have both been responsible at different times and to differing degrees. And said "All parties to the conflict must take immediate steps to ensure that the water supply in



Aleppo is permanently restored, and prevent any further interference with access to potable water, and other vital supplies. Relevant UN bodies and concerned States with influence over those parties must make that clear to them".

The Palestinian refugees in Yarmouk campus, around 18,000 persons are facing starvation. Residents have resorted to eating leaves and animal feed. Some say they cannot get access even to scraps, as a desperate blockade by government forces, in place for nearly 18 months, continues to cut off supplies.

On February 22, 2014, the Security Council took a step further by adopting Resolution 2139 expressed regret that the October 2013 presidential statement had "not yet translated into meaningful progress on the ground, and that humanitarian aid delivery continues to be impeded throughout Syria," while recalling "that starvation of civilians as a method of combat is prohibited by international humanitarian law." It also demanded that "all parties, in particular the Syrian authorities promptly allow rapid, safe and unhindered humanitarian access for UN humanitarian agencies and their implementing partners, including across conflict lines and across borders."

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº56: Continue to strengthen free education for all its people, particularly in rural areas, through "mobile schools" (Recommended by Bolivia)

IRI: not implemented

# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº57: Continue to strengthen the achievements of health indicators, particularly related to child and maternal health, through the improvement of public health services (Recommended by Bolivia)

IRI: not implemented

# DCHRS response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

There is widespread chaos. Indiscriminate bombing does not improve public health services.





# ANND+SCPR response:

Whereas in 2011 revision, the achievements of health sector was applauded the armed conflict has damaged the national healthcare system through damage and destruction to medical facilities and the healthcare infrastructure, the flight of healthcare professionals, death and injury of healthcare staff and the collapse of the pharmaceutical industry.

Moreover, human displacement, the destruction of habitat, the absence of basic needs and lack of access to clean water, or even the fear and anxiety of such privation, are all undermining the health and wellbeing of ordinary Syrians during the current conflict.

- The public health system is in a state of collapse in many areas of Syria, creating enormous burdens on existing facilities, while private and civil society facilities have capacity limitations. By 2013 fourth quarter, 61 of the 91 public hospitals across the country were damaged, with 41 of them (45 per cent) out of service, while 53 private hospitals have also been affected.
- The conflict rendered high health costs on the population requiring medical services from a health system in a state of collapse, with women and children, the sick and the injured especially at risk.
- The health of ordinary Syrians has also been compounded by scarcity and availability of pharmaceutical products, with growing disparities among different regions as cancer drugs and medicines for chronic diseases are reportedly unavailable in many areas of the country, including Dara'a, Rural Damascus, Homs, Hama, Aleppo, Idlib, Deir Ezzor, Al-Ragga, and Hassaka.

Recommendation nº60: Enhance development efforts by focusing on the rural areas (Recommended by Algeria)

IRI: not implemented

# DCHRS response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

There has been no development by the regime in the rural areas within the Kurdish region.

Recommendation nº65: Allow unhindered and sustained access for humanitarian agencies and workers and restore basic services including unhindered access to hospitals (Recommended by Poland)

IRI: not implemented





# <u>DCHRS response:</u> Not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

# **UNPO** response:

9.3 million people need humanitarian assistance inside Syria. But the provision of humanitarian assistance is being hampered by the Government and some anti-government armed groups. The aid deliveries that were possible proved insufficient to meet the needs of the affected population and there are still some locations that are inaccessible. Hospitals, medical units, and medical personnel are constantly targeted. In August 2013, a sniper shot and killed a nurse in Al-Hilal hospital, Aleppo. Medical staff suspected of treating or providing medical supplies to the opposition were detained and tortured. An example of this is the case of Dr. Abbas Khan, who died in government detention on 17 December 2013. The Government and non-state armed groups also employ siege warfare, instrumentalizing basic human needs for water, food, shelter and medical care, as part of its military strategy. The distribution of humanitarian relief, blocked medical supplies and equipment from besieged areas is severely restricted. People seeking medical treatment have been arrested or turned back at checkpoints. The denial of humanitarian aid, food and basic necessities like medical care, constitutes a violation of International humanitarian law.

# ANND+SCPR response:

Whereas in 2011 revision, the achievements of health sector was applauded the armed conflict has damaged the national healthcare system through damage and destruction to medical facilities and the healthcare infrastructure, the flight of healthcare professionals, death and injury of healthcare staff and the collapse of the pharmaceutical industry.

Moreover, human displacement, the destruction of habitat, the absence of basic needs and lack of access to clean water, or even the fear and anxiety of such privation, are all undermining the health and wellbeing of ordinary Syrians during the current conflict.

The public health system is in a state of collapse in many areas of Syria, creating enormous burdens on existing facilities, while private and civil society facilities have capacity limitations. By 2013 fourth quarter, 61 of the 91 public hospitals across the country were damaged, with 41 of them (45 per cent) out of service, while 53 private hospitals have also been affected.



- The conflict rendered high health costs on the population requiring medical services from a health system in a state of collapse, with women and children, the sick and the injured especially at risk.
- The health of ordinary Syrians has also been compounded by scarcity and availability of pharmaceutical products, with growing disparities among different regions as cancer drugs and medicines for chronic diseases are reportedly unavailable in many areas of the country, including Dara'a, Rural Damascus, Homs, Hama, Aleppo, Idlib, Deir Ezzor, Al-Raqqa, and Hassaka.

# **Minorities**

Recommendation nº50: Continue its contribution to the efforts in alleviating the suffering of the vulnerable group of refugees until they return to their homeland (Recommended by Algeria)

IRI: not implemented

# Alkarama response:

Not implemented: Since Syria's last UPR, the situation of refugees has worsened. According to UNHCR figures, more than 6,8 million Syrians, mostly internally displaced are in need for humanitarian assistance. Moreover, there is to date approximately, 2 millions of Syrians that have left the country since the beginning of the uprisings. In addition, government and rebel forces have been blocking humanitarian aid and targeted hospitals and medical centres.

#### DCHRS response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation. The Palestinians in Yarmouk camp were starved and targeted.

# **UNPO** response:

Syria's population is comprised of many refugees from other countries. In 2012, it was estimated that 1.8 million refugees in the country were from Iraq, most of whom were displaced during the Iraq war. But since the beginning of the conflict in Syria in 2011, many refugees living in Syria have returned to their countries. At the same time, approximately 2 million Syrians have fled to neighboring countries fleeing the conflict, and the number is increasing with approximately 5,000 fleeing every day. Unlawful



attacks that are causing mass civilian death and injuries continue to be the primary reason for internal displacement and refugee flows. The influx fuelled tensions between refugees and their host communities. The terrible conditions of many of the refugee camps that have emerged have compelled some refugees to return to the Syrian Arab Republic.

Recommendation n°55: Continue to seek support from the international community and relevant United Nations agencies in meeting its challenges in hosting the refugee population (Recommended by Thailand)

IRI: not implemented

# DCHRS response:

Not implemented

# HIC response:

Syrian Government still failed to provide the protection for Palestinian refugees. Before 2011 Palestinian refugees were already among the poorest communities in the country, with 27 per cent of the population estimated to be living below the poverty line – \$2 per day – and over 12 per cent unable to meet their basic food needs. The United Nations official renewed demands to allow medicine and food to be distributed without restrictions inside an unofficial refugee camp in Damascus, Syria, where as many as 18,000 Palestinian refugees have been trapped since July.

Approximately 235,000 Palestine refugees from Syria are displaced in Syria, while over 60,000 have fled the country.

Amnesty International accused Syrian regime have committed war crimes by deliberately starving civilian inhabitants of a Palestinian refugee camp during their bloody three-year war against an armed uprising. Also two-thirds of Syria's Palestinian refugees - who numbered 530,000 before the country's civil war - have been displaced, with tens of thousands being dispersed to other countries. While 200 deaths highlighted between last July and last month, 128 died of starvation, Amnesty's report asserts, after an existing siege of the camp was intensified to completely cut off food and medical supplies.

The conflict in Syria has affected humanitarian access and disrupted education and health services, exacerbating stress and uncertainty in refugee communities, according to UNRWA, which has provided basic services, and at times emergency assistance, to Palestinian refugees in Syria, Jordan, Lebanon, the West Bank and Gaza for over 63 years.



Iraqi refugees facing inhuman conditions, according to government figures, in 2011, 67,000 Iraqis in Syria returned to an Iraq which is still one of the most dangerous places, and the other still cannot moving from Syria. Some 18,000 Iraqi refugees who had already been accepted for resettlement to a third country or were awaiting interviews, have had their files frozen. Initially delayed due to new US security procedures, the cases have now been put on indefinite hold because resettlement countries have had more difficulty conducting interviews amid the unrest.

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

# **UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°50]

Recommendation nº58: Continue with its policy and its good practice to provide assistance and protect the rights of the many Palestinian refugees in the country (Recommended by Ecuador)

IRI: not implemented

# DCHRS response:

Not implemented

# HIC response:

Syrian Government still failed in provides the protection for Palestinian refugees. Before 2011 Palestinian refugees were already among the poorest communities in the country, with 27 per cent of the population estimated to be living below the poverty line – \$2 per day – and over 12 per cent unable to meet their basic food needs. The United Nations official renewed demands to allow medicine and food to be distributed without restrictions inside an unofficial refugee camp in Damascus, Syria, where as many as 18,000 Palestinian refugees have been trapped since July.

Approximately 235,000 Palestine refugees from Syria are displaced in Syria, while over 60,000 have fled the country.

Amnesty International accused Syrian regime have committed war crimes by deliberately starving civilian inhabitants of a Palestinian refugee camp during their bloody three-year war against an armed uprising. Also two-thirds of Syria's Palestinian refugees - who numbered 530,000 before the country's civil war - have been displaced, with tens of thousands being dispersed to other countries. While 200 deaths highlighted between last July and last month, 128 died of starvation, Amnesty's report asserts, after



an existing siege of the camp was intensified to completely cut off food and medical supplies.

The conflict in Syria has affected humanitarian access and disrupted education and health services, exacerbating stress and uncertainty in refugee communities, according to UNRWA, which has provided basic services, and at times emergency assistance, to Palestinian refugees in Syria, Jordan, Lebanon, the West Bank and Gaza for over 63 years.

# SKS response:

Palestinians in Yamouk camp have been starved by the regime.

Recommendation nº68: Comply with commitments enshrined in the Durban Declaration and Plan of Action, particularly as regards the prevention and punishment of discrimination against the population of Kurdish origin (Recommended by Mexico)

IRI: not implemented

# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

# HIC response:

The Kurdish situation now is not clear for their rights in the context of the state of Syria. The Kurdish are facing threats from the government and the armed opposition groups, after the government retreated from the Kurdish areas, and Kurdish take the control to protect and provide for themselves the basics needs. So the current state is absent to take its responsibility in protecting its citizens from Kurdish Syria. And even the future of reconstruction Syria is not clear for the situation of Kurdish in the plan, specifically, with the new planning from the government in changing the demographic of the opposition areas.

# SKS response:

The Kurds have been targeted by the regime in their own areas, including in Aleppo.

Recommendation nº137: Allow a Syrian-led transition to take place that will initiate change in laws and lead to the formation of an inclusive and representative government that adheres to the rule of law and upholds the rights of members of religious and ethnic minorities (Recommended by United States)

IRI: not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.





# DCHRS response: Not implemented

# **UNPO** response:

Syria has a highly ethnically and religiously diverse society with a large Sunni majority and minority groups that include Alawis, Christians, Druze and Kurds. Since anti-government protests broke out in March 2011, the Syrian regime has tried to ally with minorities against the Sunni majority. Although opposition figures have stressed that they seek a multi-ethnic and religiously tolerant society, they represent a diverse group affected by realignments and infighting. The conflict has increasingly devolved into a sectarian conflict that hinders the possibility of a peaceful solution with a transition to an inclusive and representative government. There has been an escalation in violence and reprisal acts based on ethnic and religious grounds. Minority groups feel threatened and are aligning themselves with parties to the conflict, furthering fostering hostilities along sectarian lines and increasing their chances or being targeted. Many are fleeing aerial bombardments and ground attacks by government forces. Others – often from the Alawite, Shia, Druze and Christian communities - are fleeing attack by anti-government armed groups. The Christian community in Syria, which comprises around 10% of the population, has a particularly complicated situation within the conflict, fearing violent change but being associated with Assad's crackdown. Although the majority asserts their neutrality they are caught in the middle between different warring factions. The Assad regime has used sectarianism to reinforce fears among Christians and other minorities about their fate should the government be overthrown. Assyrians, often accused of being sympathetic to the Assad regime, have increasingly come under the threat from more extreme Sunni rebel groups, and many have sought refuge across the border in Turkey's south-eastern provinces. But they are also targeted for violent persecution by government security forces for being perceived as unsupportive. Troubling reports have emerged of violence targeting Christians, of churches being looted, and of an atmosphere of hostility toward Christians. These issues will be of upmost importance when the conflict ends. Without human rights being the core of the policies and reforms, ensuring the adequate protection of minorities, there will not be a stable and peaceful resolution.

Recommendation nº163: Comply with its legal obligations concerning the rights of minorities and guarantee the civil, political, economic, social and



cultural rights of persons belonging to the Kurdish minority (Recommended by Canada)

IRI: not implemented

# DCHRS response:

Not implemented

# HIC response:

[See response to recommendation n°68]

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

# International Instruments

Recommendation nº1: Continue to harmonise its domestic laws with the international human rights conventions to which it is party, in line with democratic principles and fundamental freedoms and equality (Recommended by Indonesia)

IRI: not implemented

# Alkarama response:

Not implemented: Syria did not withdraw some of its reservations to Human Rights treaties (especially CEDAW and CRC) that have been declared by some other State parties as incompatible with the object and purpose of those treaties. The government continuously states that those treaties take precedence over national law (monist conception) and that in consequence, the law does not have to be changed. But these international rules are not applied internally.

# SKS response:

[...]

# DCHRS response:

The Syrian domestic law fails to account for a number of international human rights conventions. [...]

# <u>UNPO response:</u>

The Syrian Arab Republic is completely disregarding its international obligations stated by the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Right, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against





Women, the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, and the Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Optional Protocol thereto on the involvement of children in armed conflict. Severe human rights violations are being recorded every day, often performed by government forces.

Recommendation n°2: Bring national laws fully into line with its obligations under ICCPR, CEDAW, CAT and CRC (Recommended by Maldives)

IRI: not implemented

# Alkarama response:

Not implemented: Syria did not withdraw some of its reservations to Human Rights treaties (especially CEDAW and CRC) that have been declared by some other State parties as incompatible with the object and purpose of those treaties, as enshrined in the Vienna Convention on the right of Treaties (1969). It continuously states that those treaties take precedence over national law (monist conception) and that in consequence, the law does not have to be changed. But international rules are not applied internally.

# DCHRS response:

Syria has failed to bring national laws fully into line with its obligations under ICCPR, CEDAW, CAT, and CRC.

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

# **UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°1]

Recommendation nº5: Continue to strengthen cooperation with the Human Rights Council and its mechanisms (Recommended by Bangladesh)

IRI: not implemented

# Alkarama response:

Not implemented: The Syrian Arab Republic has systematically refused the SR on Torture, the SR on Human Rights Defenders, the SR on freedom of peaceful assembly and of association, the WG on arbitrary detention and the WG on enforced disappearances to visit this State. Only the SR on the right to food was allowed in Syria, in 2010, before the beginning of the uprisings. Moreover, Syria does not cooperate with the UN Special Procedures when it comes to comment on individual communications or to implement their observations.



# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented. The Syrian government has not cooperated fully with the HRC.

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation. The regime has engaged but not co-operated.

# **UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°1]

Recommendation nº6: Deepen and widen cooperation with the United Nations human rights system, and in particular with the Human Rights Council and its mechanisms (Recommended by Malaysia)

IRI: not implemented

# Alkarama response:

[See response to recommendation n°5]

#### DCHRS response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation. The regime has engaged but not co-operated.

# <u>UNPO response:</u>

[See response to recommendation n°1]

Recommendation nº34: Submit overdue periodic reports, as required by treaties and conventions to which Syria is a party (Recommended by Iran)

IRI: not implemented

# Alkarama response:

Not implemented: the Syrian Arab Republic was supposed to submit its report for the Convention on civil and political rights on 01 August 2009, the Convention against Torture on 14 May 2014, Convention on the elimination of all sort of racial discriminations on 21 May 2006, the Convention on social, economic and cultural rights on 30 June 2006, the Convention on migrant workers on 01 July 2011, and the Convention on the rights of persons with disabilities on 10 August 2011.

Recommendation nº59: Engage civil society in the process of implementation of UPR recommendations (Recommended by Poland)

IRI: not implemented





# **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

# SKS response:

The regime has not engaged with civil society generally.

Recommendation nº61: Amend legislation allowing the imprisonment of prisoners of conscience so as to be in compliance with the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (articles 18-22)(Recommended by Belgium)

IRI: not implemented

# Alkarama response:

Not implemented: Despite several presidential amnesties, the regime still targets political opponents and arbitrarily detains them, often under charges of terrorism as made possible by the counter-terrorism law adopted in 2012. There was a general amnesty promulgated in June 2014 but it is too early to say whether it will change the situation or not. It is notably reported that the SCM members, including Mazen Darwish, could be freed under this amnesty law.

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº62: Ensure that the new legislation regulating freedom of assembly is brought in line with international human rights law, particularly the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, to which Syria has been a party since 1969 (Recommended by Sweden)

IRI: not implemented

# Alkarama response:

Not implemented: The 2011 media law is still into force and has not been amended since. Its vague wording allows for abuses from the authorities and to prosecute journalists under the accusation of harming national interests.

# SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº63: Respect its international obligations pursuant to the United Nations human rights treaties to which it is a party (Recommended by Belgium)

IRI: not implemented

# DCHRS response:

Not implemented





## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°1]

Recommendation nº87: Incorporate into domestic law and enact the provisions of the international instruments, particularly CAT, CEDAW and CRC (Recommended by Poland)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: For instance, if the Constitution prohibits torture, the definition is not as comprehensive as the one of the Convention. Concerning the Convention on the Rights of the Child, Syria did not remove its reservation under article 14 despite the Committee has asked for it again in its concluding observations in 2012.

#### DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## **UNPO** response:

The Syrian Arab Republic is completely disregarding its international obligations stated by the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Right, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, and the Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Optional Protocol thereto on the involvement of children in armed conflict. Severe human rights violations are being recorded every day, often performed by government forces.

Recommendation nº88: *Implement the recommendations of the Committee against Torture* (Recommended by *Belgium*)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: The practice of torture is still common in Syria, as well as secret detention. No mechanism has been created to monitor and investigate cases of torture. There is still a widespread impunity for people using torture against citizens and confessions made under torture are still used in Courts.





## DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

The recommendation of the Committee against torture have not been implemented. Government forces and pro-government militia commit prevalent attacks on civilians, systematically committing murder, torture, rape and enforced disappearance. Assad's regime and its supporters have committed gross violations of human rights, crimes against humanity and numerous war crimes. Torture and other forms of ill-treatment is extensively perpetrated in detention facilities, by intelligence agencies, at checkpoints around besieged areas, during house raids, as a means to extract information and to punish and inflict terror on the population. Many deaths were recorded in custody. Non-State armed groups also committed war crimes, including murder, execution without due process, torture, hostagetaking, enforced disappearances, rape and sexual violence, attacking protected objects and forcibly displacing civilians. There are numerous reports of torture and ill-treatment of the civilian population in areas under their control, and in detention.

Recommendation nº102: Ratify the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance at an early date (Recommended by Japan)

IRI: not implemented

#### Alkarama response:

Not implemented: Syria did not accept or reject this recommendation but has so far not ratified this convention.

#### SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

#### UNPO response:

The Syrian Arab Republic has not ratified the Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance. Enforced disappearance is used by government and pro-government forces as a strategy of war, to stifle dissent and to spread terror within society. It is committed as part of a widespread attack against a civilian population, with knowledge of the attack, and constitutes a crime against humanity.

## Mid-term Implementation Assessment: Syria



Recommendation nº103: Accede to the 1951 Refugee Convention on Refugees and its 1967 Optional Protocol (Recommended by Peru)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: Syria did not ratify those instruments so far.

## **UNPO** response:

The Syrian Arab Republic has not acceded to the 1951 Refugee Convention on Refugees, nor to its 1967 Optional Protocol.

Recommendation nº104: Ratify the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment of Punishment and the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearances (Recommended by Peru)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: Syria did not accept or reject this recommendation but has so far not ratified this convention.

#### **UNPO** response:

The Syrian Arab Republic has not ratified the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment of Punishment, nor the Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance.

Recommendation nº105: Sign and ratify OPCAT and establish a national preventive mechanism (Recommended by Maldives)

IRI: not implemented

#### <u>Alkarama response:</u>

Not implemented: Syria did not accept or reject this recommendation but has so far not ratified this protocol nor created a preventive mechanism.

#### <u>UNPO response:</u>

The Syrian Arab Republic has not ratified the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment of Punishment. Furthermore, torture remains a widespread practice that goes unpunished. Severe physical and mental pain and suffering is deliberately inflicted to obtain information or confessions, as punishment, to intimidate or coerce. This breaches international human rights law and humanitarian law and both the state and individuals should be held accountable.



Recommendation nº109: Consider withdrawing the reservations to articles 14, 20 and 21 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child (Recommended by Uruguay)

IRI: partially implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: Syria has removed its reservations to article 20 and 21 but failed to do same for article 14.

Recommendation n°111: Withdraw the reservations to Article 20 of the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment and consider ratifying the Optional Protocol to this Convention (Recommended by Mexico)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: Even if Syria did not respond to this recommendation, it did not implement it in any case as it has not withdrawn its reservation nor ratified OPCAT.

## **UNPO** response:

The Syrian Arab Republic has not withdrawn its reservations to Article 20 of the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, nor has it ratified the Optional Protocol. Furthermore, torture remains a widespread practice that goes unpunished. Severe physical and mental pain and suffering is deliberately inflicted to obtain information or confessions, as punishment, to intimidate or coerce. This breaches international human rights law and humanitarian law and both the state and individuals should be held accountable.

Recommendation nº112: Implement the obligations undertaken on signing the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman and Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: There are numerous examples of confessions obtained under torture that were used before criminal or counter terrorism courts. In addition, the definition of torture as set out in the internal legislation is still not in line with the one of the Convention.

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.





#### UNPO response:

Torture remains a widespread practice that goes unpunished. Severe physical and mental pain and suffering is deliberately inflicted to obtain information or confessions, as punishment, to intimidate or coerce. This breaches international human rights law and humanitarian law and both the state and individuals should be held accountable.

Recommendation nº123: Fully cooperate with the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights and with the Special Procedures (Recommended by Guatemala)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: in addition to information already noted under other recommendations, Syria does not fully cooperate with the OHCHR and its Special Procedures. It does not reply to every communication and urgent appeals made by them and does not submit its reports in due time. Finally, it did not respond positively to requests for visits emanating from Special Rapporteurs.

#### DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## **UNPO** response:

The independent Human Rights Council mandated Commission of Inquiry on the Syrian Arab Republic is denied access to the country. Moreover, all requests for meetings with the Permanent Representative of the Syrian Arab Republic in Geneva have been unsuccessful. This greatly limits the Commission's ability to conduct an independent investigation of the situation in Syria and to reach victims from all sides of the conflict. There have been recent missions to the country by the Special Representative of the Secretary-General for Children in Armed Conflict and the United Nations investigation mission to investigate allegations of the use of chemical weapons. This could indicate an increasing willingness to cooperate by the Assad regime, and gives hopes to the commission about being allowed to visit the country in the near future.

Recommendation nº126: Positively respond to pending visits request by Special Procedures mandate holders (Recommended by Slovenia)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: The SR on Torture has requested a visit to Syria in 2005 and the authorities still haven't accepted it. For the SR on the situation of





Human Rights defenders, the visit was requested in 2008 with a reminder in 2010.

#### **UNPO** response:

There are currently no standing invitations by the Government to the thematic special procedures of the Human Rights Council. Some visits by Special Procedures Mandate Holders that are agreed to in principle and/or being considered are to the Special Rapporteur on summary executions, the Working Group on mercenaries, the Special Rapporteur on violence against women, and the Special Rapporteur on IDPs that has now been cancelled. There are numerous pending requests by the Special Rapporteur on torture, the Special Rapporteur on human rights defenders, the Special Rapporteur on freedom of peaceful assembly and of association, the Working Group on arbitrary detention and the Working Group on enforced disappearances. Furthermore, the independent Human Rights Council mandated Commission of Inquiry on the Syrian Arab Republic is denied access to the country. All requests for meetings with the Permanent Representative of the Syrian Arab Republic in Geneva have been unsuccessful. This greatly limits the Commission's ability to conduct an independent investigation of the situation in Syria and to reach victims from all sides of the conflict.

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº129: Ratify the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court (Recommended by Poland)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº130: Ratify the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court (Recommended by Brazil)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº131: Ratify the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court which it signed in 2000 (Recommended by Slovenia)

IRI: not implemented

## DCHRS response:

Not implemented





## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

#### **UNPO** response:

Syria has not ratified the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court (ICC). Thus, the ICC can only initiate an investigation of Syria through a resolution of the United Nations Security Council.

Recommendation nº164: Extend an open and standing invitation to all Special Procedures mandate-holders and fully cooperate with them, permitting them to visit the country (Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº166: Issue a standing invitation to all thematic Special Procedures mandate holders, in particular the Special Rapporteur on the rights to freedom of peaceful assembly and of association (Recommended by Ireland)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº167: Issue a standing invitation and cooperate with Special Procedures mandate holders (Recommended by Brazil)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº169: Extend a standing invitation to all Special Procedures of the Human Rights Council (Recommended by Uruguay)

IRI: not implemented

## DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## **UNPO** response:

There are currently no standing invitations by the Government to the thematic special procedures of the Human Rights Council. Some visits by Special Procedures Mandate Holders that are agreed to in principle and/or being considered are to the Special Rapporteur on summary executions, the Working Group on mercenaries, the Special Rapporteur on violence against women, and the Special Rapporteur on IDPs that has now been cancelled. There are numerous pending requests by the Special Rapporteur on torture, the Special Rapporteur on human rights defenders, the Special Rapporteur on freedom of peaceful assembly and of association, the Working Group on arbitrary detention and the Working Group on enforced disappearances.



Recommendation nº165: Issue a standing invitation to all Special Procedures mandate holders, and cooperate fully with the Commission of Inquiry established at the 17th Special Session of the Human Rights Council so that the latter shall be able to sufficiently conduct fact-finding activities and identify those responsible (Recommended by Japan)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº168: Extend an open invitation to the Special Procedures and cooperate with the human rights mechanisms of the Human Rights Council, including the Commission of Inquiry, and allow the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights access to its territory (Recommended by Spain)

IRI: not implemented

<u>DCHRS response:</u> Not implemented

**UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°126]

## **Justice**

Recommendation n°39: Ensure transparent and effective national investigations into all cases of violence and all cases of deaths and bring those responsible to justice (Recommended by Russian Federation)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº40: Put into place domestic measures and mechanisms aimed at strengthening accountability and ensure redress and reparations for victims of possible human rights violations (Recommended by Malaysia)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº98: Reform the legal system so as to entrench accountability of the military and the security apparatus, to end impunity for human rights violations committed by the members of these institutions and provide compensation to the victims (Recommended by Netherlands)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: The regime passed a law that provides impunity for unlawful killings to members of the security forces (legislative decrees n°69/2008 and 14/1969). There is no investigation done concerning cases





of arbitrary executions, torture or enforced disappearances. Even when the UN procedures request such investigations, the regime does not cooperate.

## DCHRS response:

Not implemented

#### SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

All warring parties are responsible for numerous atrocities and should be held accountable for their acts. Thousands of people have been arbitrarily arrested since the conflict began, often leading to other human rights violations like torture or unlawful killings. Detainees are typically held for days outside the law and subjected to severe ill-treatment. Extrajudicial killings without due process are regular including shootings at checkpoints, snipers killing civilians and unlawful killing of civilians during ground operations. The judiciary system fails to comply with both international standards and the Syrian Constitution and its domestic regulations. The Government should be held responsible for the protection of the rights of its citizens and has the responsibility of bringing perpetrators of violations to justice. Instead, there is no sign of willingness or ability to control its security and intelligence apparatus and has excused pro-government forces perpetrating crimes. There are no independent monitoring and investigating mechanisms in Syria and the national mechanisms are neither effective nor just. The Quasi-judicial mechanisms established by anti-government armed groups presented numerous violations too. The lack of codified law led to an inconsistent administration of justice. Essential judicial and procedural guarantees were rarely accorded, and most judicial mechanisms did not reach the necessary level of independence and impartiality.

Recommendation nº69: Take all necessary steps to ensure that torture and other inhuman and degrading treatment of civilians do not occur (Recommended by Sweden)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: the CAT concluding observations on Syria at its 48th session clearly show that Syria has not abolished the practice of torture and ill-treatment. Torture is a widespread practice used against people detained. Not later than 14 April 2014, the High Commissioner for Human Rights released a statement denouncing the rampant use of torture by authorities in Syria, as well as by some armed groups.





## DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

Government forces and pro-government militia commit prevalent attacks on civilians, systematically committing murder, torture, rape and enforced disappearance. Assad's regime and its supporters have committed gross violations of human rights, crimes against humanity and numerous war crimes. Torture and other forms of ill-treatment is extensively perpetrated in detention facilities, by intelligence agencies, at checkpoints around besieged areas, during house raids, as a means to extract information and to punish and inflict terror on the population. Many deaths were recorded in custody. Non-State armed groups also committed war crimes, including murder, execution without due process, torture, hostage-taking, enforced disappearances, rape and sexual violence, attacking protected objects and forcibly displacing civilians. There are numerous reports of torture and ill-treatment of the civilian population in areas under their control, and in detention. These crimes are not being investigated and the perpetrators are not being brought to justice.

Recommendation nº70: Put an end to massive and indiscriminate detentions and proceed as soon as possible to free prisoners of conscience and people who have been arbitrarily arrested, and end the use of torture and ill-treatments (Recommended by Spain)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Despite several presidential amnesties, the regime still targets political opponents and arbitrarily detains them, often under charges of terrorism as made possible by the counter-terrorism law adopted in 2012.

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation. This has continued, and many people have disappeared.

## **UNPO** response:

Tens of thousands of people have been arbitrarily arrested since the conflict began. The government has jailed civilians including peaceful protestors,





civil society and political activists, aid workers and journalists, physicians and lawyers without sparing women, children, and people with disabilities and serious medical conditions, often leading to other human rights violations like torture or unlawful killings. Civilians are detained without a legal basis, their detention is not justified on permissible grounds and they are systematically presented before jurisdictions that fail to comply with the most basic guarantees for the respect of principles of fair trial. Detainees in governmental detention facilities are subjected on a daily basis to the most severe human rights violations including the widespread and systematic use of torture. They are also typically held for days outside the law amounting to enforced disappearance. The judiciary system fails to comply with both international standards and the Syrian Constitution and its domestic regulations. The Government should be held responsible for the protection of the rights of its citizens and has the responsibility of bringing perpetrators of violations to justice. Instead, there is no sign of willingness or ability to control its security and intelligence apparatus and has excused pro-government forces perpetrating crimes. There are no independent monitoring and investigating mechanisms in Syria and the national mechanisms are neither effective nor just.

Recommendation nº71: Immediately and unconditionally release all those arbitrarily detained (Recommended by Norway)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: For instance, the Working Group on Arbitrary Detention has sent 6 urgent appeals to the Syrian government between November 2011 and November 2012, showing that arbitrary detention is still currently practiced in Syria. The impunity for security forces reinforces the risk for people to be arrested arbitrarily.

#### DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## <u>UNPO response:</u>

[See response to recommendation n°70]

Recommendation nº72: Release all prisoners of conscience and arbitrarily detained persons (Recommended by Poland)

IRI: not implemented





## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: For instance, the Working Group on Arbitrary Detention has sent 6 urgent appeals to the Syrian government between November 2011 and November 2012, showing that arbitrary detention is still current in Syria. Our organisation also sent some cases of arbitrary detention in Syria in 2013 and 2014.

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

#### SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

### UNPO response:

[See response to recommendation n°70]

Recommendation nº73: Free without delay prisoners of conscience and those who are arbitrarily detained (Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº74: Release prisoners of conscience and those arbitrarily detained, and immediately stop intimidation, persecutions and arbitrary arrests (Recommended by Uruguay)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº75: Ensure the immediate and unconditional release of all political prisoners, human rights defenders and detainees and make incommunicado detentions illegal (Recommended by Sweden)

IRI: not implemented

## <u>Alkarama response:</u>

Not implemented: For instance, the Working Group on Arbitrary Detention has sent 6 urgent appeals to the Syrian government between November 2011 and November 2012, showing that arbitrary detention is still currently practiced in Syria.

## DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°70]





Recommendation nº76: Take urgent action to release all prisoners who have been detained for exercising freedom of expression (Recommended by Chile)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

Failed - more have been detained. Dissent is not allowed.

## **UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°70]

Recommendation n°77: Allow all detainees access to lawyers immediately after their detention and bring them before a judge no later than 48 hours, and provide information about the whereabouts of disappeared persons (Recommended by Spain)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: The new counter-terrorism law of July 2012, that was adopted shortly after the abolition of the state of emergency law, allows for pre-trial detention up to 60 days without any judicial supervision (see Legislative decree n°55 and article 17 of the Syrian Code of Criminal Procedure). In those cases, victims are usually held incommunicado and are not allowed to see a lawyer. Moreover, the Working Group on Enforced Disappearance recently called upon international action and referred the practice of enforced disappearance in Syria as characterizing a crime against humanity.

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº78: Ensure that all detainees are afforded all fundamental safeguards from the outset of their detention, including the right to have prompt access to a lawyer and an independent medical examination and to notify a relative (Recommended by Poland)

IRI: not implemented





## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: For instance under the counter-terrorism law of 2012, people can be detained up to 60 days before being brought before a judge. In those cases, they are not allowed to have a lawyer. Moreover, confessions obtained under torture are commonly used in courts.

## DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation. People disappear into the system.

Recommendation nº79: Establish an independent and impartial judiciary system (Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº80: Undertake reforms of the judicial system to ensure that the procedures are in conformity with international standards for an equitable judgment (article 14 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights) (Recommended by Belgium)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: If the State of Emergency law that was in force since 1963 was lifted in 2011 that did not lead to any improvement in the judiciary system. The State Security Court has been replaced by the Counter Terrorism Court, created after law n°22 and n°19 of July 2012. This court is competent for trying both military and civilians, in violation of fair trial international norms. Moreover, it always has a military judge, even for cases concerning civilians. To the discretion of the prosecutor, this court can be competent for charges that are not related to terrorism. But even in the scope of the counter terrorism law, the wording is so broad that authorities can charge peaceful activists of "terrorist activities". Finally, Article 7.g of this law should guarantee the accused his "right of defense", but as the same time stipulates that the court does not adhere to standard trial procedures. For instance, the court does not have to have open trials. Article 5 stipulates that instead of standard criminal appellate procedures, the accused may only seek review of a judgment from a special branch of the Court of Cassation. In the case of trials in absentia, Article 6 stipulates that the accused does not have a right to a retrial unless the person surrenders voluntarily. There are several other extraordinary courts that were created and that are not stipulated in the Constitution, thus putting them in a legal vacuum allowing for unfair trials. Other courts, notably on



the administrative side remain under the direct control of the executive as it is linked to the Prime's Minister office.

## DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°40]

Recommendation nº89: Immediately end all acts of torture and hold accountable those responsible for such acts (Recommended by Norway)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: The practice of torture is still common in Syria, as well as secret detention. No mechanism has been created to monitor and investigate cases of torture. There is still a widespread impunity for people using torture against citizens and confessions made under torture are used in Courts.

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°69]

Recommendation n°90: Conduct a credible and impartial investigation and address all allegations of human rights violations with a view to bringing the perpetrators to justice (Recommended by Thailand)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº93: Bring to justice those who commit arbitrary killings, acts of torture and other human rights violations (Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: not implemented

## <u>Alkarama response:</u>

Not implemented: In its last report to the Human Rights Council, the Independent International Commission of Inquiry on Syria put an emphasis





on stage of impunity for perpetrators of gross violations of Human Rights in Syria. The lack of independence of the judiciary also prohibits a real accountability for the few that are effectively prosecuted.

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°69]

Recommendation n°91: Immediately and independently investigate the deaths of all the 88 men and children reported by Amnesty International on 31 August to have died whilst in custody and the thousands of peaceful protestors, including 100 children, reported by the United Nations to have been killed since the protests began in mid-March 2011 (Recommended by United Kingdom)

IRI: not implemented

## DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº92: Undertake an extensive investigation into acts of on-going violence as well as all allegations of human rights violations (Recommended by South Africa)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation. Acts of violence continue.

## **UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°69]

Recommendation nº94: Promptly undertake measures to address allegations relating to instances of involuntary disappearances, arbitrary arrests, the routine use of torture, violence against women and girls, lack of





judicial independence, impunity granted to the members of intelligence agencies, persecution of human rights defenders, and restriction of freedoms of expression and assembly, and carry out fundamental reforms of its laws, policies and practices with a view to improving the current dire human rights situation and preventing its recurrence (Recommended by Republic of Korea)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: In its last report to the Human Rights Council, the Independent International Commission of Inquiry on Syria emphasized on impunity for perpetrators of gross violations of Human Rights in Syria. The lack of independence of the judiciary also prohibits a real accountability for the few that are effectively prosecuted. Additionally, all legal reforms that have been undertook since the beginning of the uprisings were intended at tightening freedoms and rights of citizens and not widening them (see the counter-terrorism law, the law on media).

#### DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

Involuntary disappearances continue - the regime takes people and denies that this has taken place. Those people then disappear into the system.

Recommendation n°95: End impunity through a credible investigation by the special judicial commission and try those responsible for human rights violations (Recommended by Spain)

IRI: not implemented

#### <u>Alkarama response:</u>

Not implemented: Syria did not create such judicial commission.

#### **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

#### SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

#### **UNPO** response:

Government forces and pro-government militia commit prevalent attacks on civilians, systematically committing murder, torture, rape and enforced disappearance. Assad's regime and its supporters have committed gross violations of human rights, crimes against humanity and numerous war crimes. The attacks were unjustified and of disproportionate force, causing





indiscriminate and arbitrary suffering amongst civilians and perpetrating massacres. Government forces continue to unlawfully kill those perceived as potential enemies. Rape, sexual torture and sexual violence was also committed against men, women and children as part of a widespread attack, where civilians were targeted for detention and subjected to multiple violations. These crimes are not being investigated and the perpetrators are not being brought to justice.

Recommendation n°97: Review manuals, training and rules of engagement of the security apparatus in the light of the principles developed in the Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials and the Basic Principles of the Use of Force and Firearms by Law Enforcement Officials (Recommended by Netherlands)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº152: Carry out thorough, transparent and independent investigations into all reports of alleged human rights violations and abuses since March 2011, and bring the perpetrators to justice (Recommended by Canada)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## **UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°39]

Recommendation nº106: Ensure that the judicial definitions contained in human rights treaties are incorporated effectively and in a timely fashion in its national legislation (Recommended by Peru)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: As said above, the definition of torture is not in line with the CAT. Moreover, some reservations made to CEDAW are incompatible with the object and purpose of this treaty.

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

The Syrian Arab Republic is completely disregarding its international obligations stated by the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Right, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against





Women, the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, and the Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Optional Protocol thereto on the involvement of children in armed conflict. Severe human rights violations are being recorded every day, often performed by government forces.

Recommendation nº107: Adopt a definition of torture in conformity with the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Recommended by Brazil)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: if the Constitution prohibits torture, its definition is not as comprehensive as the one set out in CAT.

## DCHRS response:

Not implemented

Recommendation nº108: Incorporate in the domestic legislation the definition of torture, in line with the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, and ensure that no statement made as a result of torture can be invoked as evidence in any judicial proceedings, in conformity with Article 15 of this Convention (Recommended by Mexico)

IRI: not implemented

#### <u>Alkarama response:</u>

See above [recommendation n°107]. There are numerous examples of confessions obtained under torture that were used before criminal or counter terrorism courts.

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

#### SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº127: Respond favourably to the requests of the Special Rapporteurs on torture and on the situation of human rights defenders to visit the country (Recommended by Belgium)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: The SR on Torture has requested a visit to Syria in 2005 and the authorities still have not accepted it. For the SR on the situation of





Human Rights defenders, the visit was requested in 2008 with a reminder in 2010.

## **UNPO** response:

There are currently no standing invitations by the Government to the thematic special procedures of the Human Rights Council. Some visits by Special Procedures Mandate Holders that are agreed to in principle and/or being considered are to the Special Rapporteur on summary executions, the Working Group on mercenaries, the Special Rapporteur on violence against women, and the Special Rapporteur on IDPs that has now been cancelled. There are numerous pending requests by the Special Rapporteur on torture, the Special Rapporteur on human rights defenders, the Special Rapporteur on freedom of peaceful assembly and of association, the Working Group on arbitrary detention and the Working Group on enforced disappearances.

Recommendation nº138: Cease the de facto restitution of the death penalty and executions (Recommended by Uruguay)

IRI: not implemented

## DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº140: Heed the calls of the international community by immediately ending the repression and the climate of terror that it has imposed on its own population by respecting in all circumstances the rules of international law and by bringing to justice those responsible and the perpetrators of these crimes (Recommended by France)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°95]

Recommendation nº149: Prosecute all those responsible for the massscale criminal acts that have taken place in the past months, including



## Mid-term Implementation Assessment: Syria



members of security units, responsible commanders and politicians (Recommended by Czech Republic)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº178: Investigate all cases of forced disappearances, put an end to secrete detentions and provide reparation to victims (Recommended by Czech Republic)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°39]

Recommendation nº160: Reform the justice system, ensuring its compliance with international standards for fair trial (Recommended by Canada)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## <u>UNPO response:</u>

The judiciary system fails to comply with both international standards and the Syrian Constitution and its domestic regulations. The Government should be held responsible for the protection of the rights of its citizens and has the responsibility of bringing perpetrators of violations to justice. Instead, there is no sign of willingness or ability to control its security and intelligence apparatus and has excused pro-government forces perpetrating crimes. There are no independent monitoring and investigating mechanisms in Syria and the national mechanisms are neither effective nor just.

Recommendation nº170: Continue to strengthen the work of the independent commission established to investigate the whereabouts of disappeared persons (Recommended by Bolivia)

IRI: not implemented

+





Recommendation nº172: Immediately halt the violence against its citizens, which is causing many deaths and injuries, including those of women and children (Recommended by Japan)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº179: Ensure the prompt, impartial and effective investigation into persisting acts of harassment and persecution against human rights defenders (Recommended by Slovenia)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº180: Take immediate steps to stop the arrests of human rights defenders and political dissidents, in accordance with its international human rights obligations (Recommended by Norway)

IRI: not implemented

## DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## <u>UNPO response:</u>

[See response to recommendation n°70]

## Women & Children

Recommendation nº3: Maintain the positive momentum in improving legislation and institutions, and ensure the execution of its laws in practice, in particular in the areas of education, women rights, childhood, persons with disabilities and victims of trafficking in persons (Recommended by Venezuela)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: Syria did not withdraw some of its reservations to Human Rights treaties (especially CEDAW and CRC) that have been declared by some other State parties as incompatible with the object and purpose of





those treaties, as enshrined in the Vienna Convention on the right of Treaties (1969). It continuously states that those treaties take precedence over national law (monist conception) and that in consequence, the law does not have to be changed. But international rules are not applied internally.

## DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº30: Enhance policies and measures to protect social vulnerable groups, especially women, children and elderly persons (Recommended by Viet Nam)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation. These vulnerable people, including children are deliberately detained and tortured, and killed. There is indiscriminate killing by the use of barrel bombs in civilian areas.

Recommendation nº31: Adopt a comprehensive national human rights plan of action and finalise the national plan for the protection of women and children (Recommended by Indonesia)

IRI: not implemented

## DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## KARAMA response:

This has not been addressed. If the Syrian government had done a national plan and before the crisis in 2011, and if an integrated process for the application of resolution 1325 had been implemented this plan, that decision would have spared many Syrian women from the ravages of the current conflict and enabled them to play a greater role in the peace process.



## Mid-term Implementation Assessment: Syria



Recommendation n°32: Adopt a comprehensive National Plan of Action geared towards solving the issue of street children (Recommended by Uruguay)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation. [...]

Recommendation n°35: Strengthens efforts to further promote empowerment of women (Recommended by Bangladesh)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº38: Step up efforts to prevent and combat trafficking in persons, in particular women and children (Recommended by Belarus)

IRI: not implemented

## DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## KARAMA response:

Women continue being imported to Syria from Africa and East Asia for the purpose of domestic service, and from Eastern Europe and Iraq for the purposes of sexual exploitation, even after the enactment of Trafficking Law No. 3 of 2010. A 2013 report to the United Nations pointed out that Syria has entered the black list of countries with the most trafficking in human beings.

Recommendation nº41: Strengthen efforts to prevent violence against and abuse of children (Recommended by Bangladesh)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: Children are imprisoned with adults and subject to ill-treatment, which was stressed out by the Committee on the rights of the child. It has been reported that thousands of children have been killed by forces since the beginning of the uprisings in March 2011.





## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation. Barrels bombs kill indiscriminately.

Recommendation nº66: Take measures to address the low levels of representation of women in public and political life and in decision-making (Recommended by Slovenia)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

We have not seen improvement.

## KARAMA response:

In election law No. 5 of 2014, the State remains devoted to the principle of males enshrined in the Presidency of the Republic, specifically Article 30 which stipulates among the terms to run for the presidency of the Republic that he must be a Syrian not married to a foreigner. This adds to the discriminatory articles the Syrian Constitution, in which Article III deprives non-Muslims of the office of the presidency, and assigns masculine language to the position of President of the Republic in Syria.

Recommendation nº67: Take urgent measures to protect the most vulnerable groups, with particular attention to boys and girls (Recommended by Chile)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

We have not seen improvement.

Recommendation nº100: Revise its Personal Status Act to ensure that women and men have equal rights (Recommended by Brazil)

IRI: partially implemented

## KARAMA response:

With each change and amendment to the Personal Status Law a group of objectors argue that the change does not comply with Islamic law, and that





women's legal remedies do not exist in any way except pursuant to the teachings of Shariah.

The continuation of the Syrian Arab Republic in its reservation to Article 16 of CEDAW in matters relating to marriage and family relations contributes to undermining the spirit and primary objective of the convention.

Syrian Resolution No. 914 /I issued by the Minister of Justice on 04/01/2013 included the formation of a committee headed by a female judge who is Chancellor of the Court of Cassation's task force for review of legal texts, to determine which texts are discriminatory against women, and to make recommendations thereon or on domestic violence against women and children, and to work to repeal or modify the legal texts in line with the provisions of the Constitution. The Committee should meet at the invitation of its president at the time and place to be determined, and the job is to be done within six months at the most. But the recommendations of this committee to amend the laws are not yet available.

Recommendation nº136: Adopt and enforce laws against domestic violence, and remove mitigating factors from the punishment of "honour-crimes" against women (Recommended by Canada)

IRI: not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## KARAMA response:

Syria occupies fifth place in terms of most honor killings in the world. Honor killings reached in the province of Idlib a peak rate of 22% of the crimes committed. Aleppo comes in second place where honor killings amounted to 18% of the crimes. There remain 3 instances where Syrian legislation mitigates the punishment related to the assault on women:

- 1. Syrian law grants extenuating circumstances in Article 548 when an assault or homicide occurs after witnessing adultery by one's wife or female relative or suspicious behavior with another
- 2. The law granting extenuating circumstances in Article 562
- Article 192 of Syrian penal law, which is considered the most dangerous material in Syrian legislation, as it provides for honor killings by allowing judges to reduce the punishment if a murder was committed in rage and motivated by any illegal act on the part of the victim.

The State should repeal these articles as a whole and not just partial amendment. Furthermore, in Syrian penal law there is no separate article





relating to domestic violence. As a result, it is not a criminal act of its own definition. With respect to the issue of delaying the issuance of the domestic violence law because of the current crisis, draft legislation was produced seven years ago, and has not been approved even today.

#### **Other**

Recommendation nº4: Maintain a relation of cooperation with the universal system of promotion and protection of human rights (Recommended by Uruguay)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: The Syrian Arab Republic has systematically refused visits requests from the SR on Torture, the SR on Human Rights Defenders, the SR on freedom of peaceful assembly and of association, the WG on arbitrary detention and the WG on enforced disappearances. Only the SR on the right to food was allowed to visit Syria, in 2010, before the beginning of the uprisings. Moreover, Syria does not cooperate with the UN Special Procedures when it comes to comment on individual communications or implement their observations.

#### DCHRS response:

Not implemented

#### SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

#### **UNPO** response:

The Syrian Arab Republic is completely disregarding its international obligations stated by the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Right, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, and the Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Optional Protocol thereto on the involvement of children in armed conflict. Severe human rights violations are being recorded every day, often performed by government forces.

## Mid-term Implementation Assessment: Syria



Recommendation nº7: Establish a national human rights institution in line with the Paris Principles (Recommended by Indonesia)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº8: Establish a national human rights institution accredited by the International Coordinating Committee (Recommended by Poland)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº9: Establish a national institution for the promotion and protection of human rights with a broad mandate and independent membership (Recommended by Bolivia)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: So far, the Syrian Arab Republic did not create a national human rights institution.

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

A national human rights institution has yet to be established in the Syrian Arab Republic.

Recommendation nº11: Continue to implement measures to enhance national capacities for the promotion and protection of human rights (Recommended by Belarus)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

A national human rights institution has yet to be established in the Syrian Arab Republic.





Recommendation nº12: Continue to confront attempts of foreign intervention into its domestic affairs and to exercise fully its people's right to self-determination and the country's sovereignty (Recommended by Cuba)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

The Syrian government allows Iran to have the final say in much of its foreign policy and internal affairs.

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation. Bashar al-Assad has welcomed the intervention of foreign powers such as Hezbollah and Abo al-Fadl al-Abas brigade from Iraq, and Iranian forces.

Recommendation nº13: Continue the process of taking measures at the national level as well as the national dialogue under the guidance of its legitimate authorities as a means of a political solution to the situation in the country (Recommended by Cuba)

IRI: partially implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Syria has made non-inclusive efforts likely with the goal of weakening and co-opting the internal political opposition.

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## KARAMA response:

The Syrian government has not seriously engaged in a constructive dialogue with the opposition. There have been different attempts for reconciliation but only at a superficial level, and thus far this has not solved the problem nor accepted and integrated the armed group.

At least some Syrian civil society groups would like to continue working with the current state institutions, as it is very important to preserve the state while changing the regime as a means of political change.

These Syrian civil society groups also would like to work towards building a means for a constructive dialogue by working with the current institutions and lobbying for change.

Recommendation nº16: Find a formula to reinitiate a respectful dialogue between the various parties and to find a peaceful solution to the problem (Recommended by Ecuador)

IRI: not implemented





#### DCHRS response:

All "resolution" dialogue between the Syrian government and "various parties" is conducted in the context of starvation campaigns in which civilian leaders are negotiating for the right of their communities to receive food aid.

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## KARAMA response:

Syrian civil society groups need to work towards building a formula for dialogue and peaceful change and this needs lobbying at the international level to build international consensus for peaceful political process.

It also needs to work with Syrians inside the country and build a public opinion in favor of such solution.

Recommendation nº17: Take more tangible steps to promote and protect the human rights of its citizens, by continuing to engage all relevant parties in an open and meaningful dialogue (Recommended by Iran)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented. The Syrian government has not engaged in any open and meaningful with relevant parties nor has it taken steps to promote and protect the human rights of Syrians.

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## KARAMA response:

Some Syrian civil society groups aim to support the human rights of Syrians by lobbying at the international level to support the human rights for all Syrians, stressing that this should not be viewed as support for political sides of the conflict, as human rights are a culture and not a political action.

Recommendation nº19: Intensify an all-inclusive transparent process with a view to fulfilling the aspirations of all Syrian people (Recommended by South Africa)

IRI: not implemented

## DCHRS response:

The Syrian government has expressed no intent to "fulfill the aspirations of all Syrian people." In recent president elections, the mere holding of which





represent a snubbing of these aspirations, the Syrian government made no effort to ensure the full participation of the Syrian people.

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

In March 2011, a series of protests started taking place in Syria seeking political and economic reforms within the framework of the existing government. The violent crackdown of Assad's regime caused escalation in the conflict with an armed rebellion seeking to overthrow Bashar al-Assad and his family. This has led to a full-fledged civil war in which more than 3 million people have fled Syria and in excess of 2.5 million of them have registered as refugees; 6.5 million are displaced within Syria; 3 million Syrians need assistance within the country; 200,000 live in areas besieged by Syrian government forces and 40,000 in areas surrounded by opposition fighters. The few concessions and promised reforms by President Assad have proven insufficient and lost all credibility by brutalities perpetuated by security forces. Government forces and progovernment militia commit prevalent attacks on civilians, systematically committing murder, torture, rape and enforced disappearance. Assad's regime and its supporters have committed gross violations of human rights, crimes against humanity and numerous war crimes. The attacks were unjustified and of disproportionate force, causing indiscriminate and amongst civilians suffering and perpetrating Government forces continue to unlawfully kill those perceived as potential enemies. A peaceful resolution to the conflict is not possible without the implementation of a reform process that takes into account the aspirations of the Syrian people and that introduces human rights as the core in all policies and reforms.

## KARAMA response:

This only could happen when the international consensus is achieved and it should be bottom up and top-down, from all sides.

Change at international level should be encouraged by lobbying and working with state and society institutions.

Recommendation n°21: End conflict and violence and reach a political solution through dialogue and national reconciliation in order to bring Syria back to a normal situation (Recommended by Viet Nam)

IRI: not implemented





Recommendation nº25: Make every effort to put an end to violence, implement genuine political reforms at this critical juncture, and continue to work towards reaching a peaceful solution through negotiations and dialogue, in order to spare further bloodshed of the brotherly Syrian people, and preserve its security and stability and the unity of territorial integrity (Recommended by Sudan)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

#### SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

The conflict in Syria seems nowhere near its culmination; instead, it has grown in intensity and scope. Gross human rights violations have been committed by all sides, particularly by forces loyal to the Assad regime, with many cases amounting to war crimes and crimes against humanity. The sectarian dimension of the conflict is being exacerbated, further threatening any resolution possible in the country. The conflict is even reigniting tensions in the neighboring countries and endangering the stability in the whole region.

Recommendation nº23: Expedite its reforms such as measures to raise citizens' living standards and duly take into account the aspirations of the people of Syria in the reform process (Recommended by Thailand)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº26: Facilitate unfettered access to humanitarian aid and assistance, particularly to the regions and communities most affected by the conflict (Recommended by Malaysia)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

Not implemented: Several reports have shown that the regime and the rebels as well, have blocked humanitarian relief not later than March 2014. For instance, the Red Crescent/Cross was denied access by the army to Aleppo central prison even though this humanitarian aid sometimes





represents the only assistance the population has. Moreover, the situation of humanitarian workers is very difficult. In 2013, seven members of the Red Cross have been abducted. The Red Cross made a call for the authorities and the rebels to allow them to work in line with the Red Cross's values and mandate. The UN Secretary General recently (March 2014) recognized that both sides of the Syrian conflict were impeding humanitarian work. Our organization also sent several communications to the UN Special Procedures concerning Syrian humanitarian relief workers that had been targeted by the regime because of their humanitarian activities. The authorities have denied humanitarian organizations to deliver medicines and supplies in several cities of Syria.

#### DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

Aid went to the area of al-Assad's people, but an embargo was placed on for example Homs and Yamouk where civilians were starving.

#### **UNPO** response:

9.3 million people need humanitarian assistance inside Syria. But the provision of humanitarian assistance is being hampered by the Government and some anti-government armed groups. The aid deliveries that were possible proved insufficient to meet the needs of the affected population and there are still some locations that are inaccessible. Hospitals, medical units, and medical personnel are constantly targeted. In August 2013, a sniper shot and killed a nurse in Al-Hilal hospital, Aleppo. Medical staff suspected of treating or providing medical supplies to the opposition were detained and tortured. An example of this is the case of Dr. Abbas Khan, who died in government detention on 17 December 2013. The Government and non-state armed groups also employ siege warfare, instrumentalizing basic human needs for water, food, shelter and medical care, as part of its military strategy. The distribution of humanitarian relief, blocked medical supplies and equipment from besieged areas is severely restricted. People seeking medical treatment have been arrested or turned back at checkpoints. The denial of humanitarian aid, food and basic necessities like medical care, constitutes a violation of International humanitarian law.

Recommendation nº27: Provide unhindered access to humanitarian assistance to both its population and foreign nationals (Recommended by Thailand)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:





[See response to recommendation n°26]

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°26]

Recommendation nº101: Put an end to all human rights violations (Recommended by Poland)

IRI: not implemented

## DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

#### <u>UNPO response:</u>

Government forces and pro-government militia commit prevalent attacks on civilians, systematically committing murder, torture, rape and enforced disappearance. Assad's regime and its supporters have committed gross violations of human rights, crimes against humanity and numerous war crimes. Torture and other forms of ill-treatment is extensively perpetrated in detention facilities, by intelligence agencies, at checkpoints around besieged areas, during house raids, as a means to extract information and to punish and inflict terror on the population. Many deaths were recorded in custody. Non-State armed groups also committed war crimes, including murder, execution without due process, torture, hostage-taking, enforced disappearances, rape and sexual violence, attacking protected objects and forcibly displacing civilians. There are numerous reports of torture and ill-treatment of the civilian population in areas under their control, and in detention. These crimes are not being investigated and the perpetrators are not being brought to justice.

Recommendation nº113: Allow the Human Rights Council mandated Commission of Inquiry immediate and unhindered access to Syria (Recommended by United Kingdom)

IRI: not implemented







Recommendation nº114: Cooperate with the Commission of Inquiry established by the Human Rights Council (Recommended by Brazil)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº115: Cooperate with the international community, in particular through cooperation with the Office for the High Commissioner for Human Rights and the recently established Commission of Inquiry (Recommended by Slovenia)

IRI: partially implemented

+

Recommendation nº116: Cooperate with the competent authorities of the United Nations and in particular accept the visit of the Independent Commission of Inquiry composed of international experts (Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: partially implemented

+

Recommendation nº117: Cooperate with the United Nations and Human Rights Council mechanisms, particularly the Commission of Inquiry established by the Human Rights Council (Recommended by Thailand)

IRI: partially implemented

+

Recommendation nº118: Fully cooperate with the Independent International Commission of Inquiry established under Human Rights Council resolution S-17/1 (Recommended by Norway)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº119: Extend cooperation to the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights so that the Office can visit Syria as soon as possible, and facilitate the investigation requested by the Human Rights Council (Recommended by Chile)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº120: Allow the International Commission of Inquiry to visit the country to better understand the situation on the ground, and to work with the Government and other stakeholders to ensure accountability and to promote human rights reform (Recommended by Maldives)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº121: Fully cooperate with the United Nations human rights mechanisms, including in particular the Commission of Inquiry mandated by the Human Rights Council (Recommended by Republic of Korea)

IRI: not implemented





+

Recommendation nº122: Fully implement Human Rights Council resolutions S-17/1 of 23 August 2011 and to fully cooperate with the independent commission of inquiry (Recommended by Germany)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº124: Extend all necessary cooperation to the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights for its staff to visit as quickly as possible and to carry out the investigations mandated by resolution S-16/1 (Recommended by Peru)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº147: Allow full and unfettered access to the United Nations Human Rights Council's Commission of Inquiry established under Human Rights Council resolution S-17/1 (Recommended by Australia)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº148: Allow for a prompt, impartial and independent investigation into all human rights abuses and grant the OHCHR immediate access to conduct investigations (Recommended by Sweden)

IRI: partially implemented

+

Recommendation n°150: Immediately respect the decisions of the Human Rights Council and fully cooperate with the international Commission of Inquiry, including by granting access on the ground and by not inhibiting the mission which it has been entrusted with (Recommended by France)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation nº153: Cooperate with the United Nations by giving the Commission of Inquiry established by the United Nations Human Rights Council unfettered access to the country so that it may carry out its mandate (Recommended by Canada)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

#### <u>UNPO response:</u>

The independent Human Rights Council mandated Commission of Inquiry on the Syrian Arab Republic is denied access to the country. Moreover, all requests for meetings with the Permanent Representative of the Syrian Arab Republic in Geneva have been unsuccessful. This greatly limits the



## Mid-term Implementation Assessment: Syria



Commission's ability to conduct an independent investigation of the situation in Syria and to reach victims from all sides of the conflict. There have been recent missions to the country by the Special Representative of the Secretary-General for Children in Armed Conflict and the United Nations investigation mission to investigate allegations of the use of chemical weapons. This could indicate an increasing willingness to cooperate by the Assad regime, and gives hopes to the commission about being allowed to visit the country in the near future.

Recommendation nº154: Allow, without restrictions, unhindered access to the country for neutral observers and humanitarian actors (Recommended by Norway)

IRI: not implemented

## Alkarama response:

[See response to recommendation n°26]

#### DCHRS response:

Not implemented

#### SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

Recommendation nº161: Respond to the legitimate demands of the Syrian people with a credible process for reform (Recommended by Australia)

IRI: not implemented

## DCHRS response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°19]

Recommendation nº176: Immediately bring to an end the violence and repression against the civilian population (Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: not implemented

#### **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.



## Mid-term Implementation Assessment: Syria



Recommendation nº181: Allow for a free and unimpeded access of humanitarian organisations, medical teams and ambulances (Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: not implemented

## **DCHRS** response:

Not implemented

## SKS response:

The Government of Syria has failed to implement this recommendation.

## **UNPO** response:

[See response to recommendation n°26]



# Methodology

#### A. First contact

Although the methodology has to consider the specificities of each country, we apply the same procedure for data collection about all States:

- 1. We contact the Permanent Mission to the UN either in Geneva or New York;
- 2. We contact all NGOs that took part in the process. Whenever NGOs were part of coalitions, each NGO is contacted individually;
- 3. The National Institution for Human Rights is contacted, whenever one exists.
- 4. UN Agencies, which sent information for the UPR, are also contacted.

We post our requests to the States and send e-mails to NHRIs, NGOs and UN Agencies.

The purpose of the UPR is to discuss issues and share concrete suggestions to improve human rights on the ground. Therefore, stakeholders whose objective is not to improve the human rights situation are not contacted and those stakeholders' submissions are not taken into account.

However, since the UPR is meant to be a process that aims to share best practices among States and stakeholders, we take into account positive feedbacks from the latter.

#### B. Processing recommendations and voluntary pledges

The stakeholders that we contact are encouraged to use an Excel sheet, which we provide, that includes all recommendations received and voluntary pledges taken by the State reviewed.

Each submission is processed, whether the stakeholder has or has not used the Excel sheet. In the latter case, the submission is split among recommendations to which we think it belongs. Since such a task is more prone to misinterpretation, we strongly encourage stakeholders to use the Excel sheet.

If the stakeholder does not clearly mention whether the recommendation was "fully implemented" or "not implemented", *UPR Info* usually considers the recommendation as "partially implemented", unless the implementation level is obvious.

UPR Info retains the right to edit comments that are considered to not directly address the recommendation in question, when comments are too lengthy or when comments are defamatory or inappropriate. While we do not mention the



recommendations which were not addressed, they can be accessed unedited on the follow-up webpage.

C. Implementation Recommendation Index (IRI)

*UPR Info* developed an index showing the implementation level achieved by the State for both recommendations received and voluntary pledges taken at the UPR.

The **Implementation Recommendation Index** (IRI) is an individual recommendation index. Its purpose is to show an average of stakeholders' responses.

The *IRI* is meant to take into account stakeholders disputing the implementation of a recommendation. Whenever a stakeholder claims nothing has been implemented at all, the index score is 0. At the opposite, whenever a stakeholder claims a recommendation has been fully implemented, the *IRI* score is 1.

An average is calculated to fully reflect the many sources of information. If the State under Review claims that the recommendation has been fully implemented, and a stakeholder says it has been partially implemented, the score is 0.75.

Then the score is transformed into an implementation level, according to the table below:

Percentage:	Implementation level:
0 - 0.32	Not implemented
0.33 - 0.65	Partially implemented
0.66 – 1	Fully implemented

<u>Example</u>: On one side, a stakeholder comments on a recommendation requesting the establishment of a National Human Rights Institute (NHRI). On the other side, the State under review claims having partially set up the NHRI. As a result of this, the recommendation is given an *IRI* score of 0.25, and thus the recommendation is considered as "not implemented".

#### Disclaimer

The comments made by the authors (stakeholders) are theirs alone, and do not necessarily reflect the views and opinions at UPR Info. Every attempt has been made to ensure that information provided on this page is accurate and not abusive. UPR Info cannot be held responsible for information provided in this document.



# **Uncommented recommendations**

Hereby the recommendations which the MIA does not address:

rec. n°	Recommendation	SMR	Response	Α	Issue
10	Consider establishing additional national human rights mechanisms to promote and protect human rights	Lebanon	Accepted	3	NHRI
22	Accelerate and follow-up on implementation of the package of reforms as announced by the country's leadership	Malaysia	Accepted	4	General
28	Ensure broader opportunities for human rights training for the members of the security forces	Venezuela	Accepted	4	Human rights education and training
36	Consider strengthening all measures aimed at promoting gender equity and the full and effective participation of women in the political, social, economic and cultural spheres of life, including through legislative and administrative means	South Africa	Accepted	3	Women's rights
37	Immediately adopt and implement necessary legislative and administrative measures to promote a greater inclusion of women in the country's public and political life, ensuring that they effectively participate in the decision-making process, and lift the reservations made to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women	Mexico	Accepted	5	International instruments, Women's rights
51	Continue its efforts to halt the brain drain to foreign countries	DPR Korea	Accepted	2	Other
64	Publish a detailed roadmap of planned human rights and political reforms	Maldives	Accepted	5	General
85	Take concrete steps to implement international legal obligations to protect peaceful assembly in line with calls from the United Nations Secretary General and the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights	United Kingdom	Accepted	4	Freedom of association and peaceful assembly
110	Withdraw reservations to all international human rights treaties to which it is a party, and consider the ratification of the outstanding human rights treaties	Slovenia	Noted	5	International instruments
125	Act upon the resolutions adopted by the Human Rights Council	Guatemala	Accepted	4	Other

# Mid-term Implementation Assessment: Syria



rec. n°	Recommendation	SMR	Response	Α	Issue
128	Ratify or accede, as appropriate, to the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court, the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance, the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment of Punishment and the Second Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	Uruguay	Noted	5	Death penalty, Detention conditions, Enforced disappearances, International instruments, Justice, Torture and other CID treatment
132	Withdraw its reservations to various international human rights instruments so as to allow complaints both by individuals and from other States parties	Peru	Noted	5	International instruments
133	Take heed of the concerns expressed by relevant Treaty Bodies, including on the right to life administration of justice, and gender equality, and fully implement the provisions of the respective treaties	Japan	Noted	4	International instruments, Justice, Treaty bodies, Women's rights
134	Integrate into national legislation the principles and provisions of international human rights instruments ratified by Syria, and abolish laws that contradict them	Canada	Noted	5	International instruments
135	Abolish legislative provisions that grant state officials immunity from prosecution, notably by repealing Decrees 14/1969 and 69/2008	Canada	Noted	5	Human rights violations by state agents,Impunity
144	Allow the access of international observers to the places of detention	Switzerland	Noted	5	Detention conditions
145	Place all places of detention under effective judicial supervision and apply international standards for the treatment of detainees	Canada	Noted	5	Detention conditions
151	Ensure full compliance with the recommendations of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights as contained in her report to the Human Rights Council of 15 September 2011, reference number A/HRC/18/53	Slovakia	Noted	4	Other
159	Introduce a new media law removing all prison penalties for defamation and libel and guaranteeing the right to be informed by all means, including the internet	Canada	Noted	5	Freedom of opinion and expression,Freedom of the press
162	Establish a registration system to license independent nongovernmental organizations consistent with the right to freedom of association	Canada	Noted	5	Civil society,Freedom of association and peaceful assembly
171	Revoke recently introduced laws that obstruct fundamental freedoms	Poland	Noted	5	General

# Mid-term Implementation Assessment: Syria



rec. n°	Recommendation	SMR	Response	Α	Issue
177	Bring its action in line with the assistance provided by the Council, the Secretary-General of the United Nations and the High Commissioner for Human Rights, so as to cease the violent repression, initiate an open national dialogue which is inclusive and transparent, and initiate a reliable and transparent investigation into the violent repression, which has resulted in a high number of injured and dead protestors	Uruguay	Noted	4	General
182	Lift its ban over censored websites and revoke the newly-adopted law whick introduced an even stricter media censorship	Czech Republic	Noted	5	Freedom of opinion and expression,Freedom of the press

A= Action Category (see on <u>our website</u>) SMR = State making recommendation

# **Contact**

#### **UPR Info**

Rue de Varembé 3 CH - 1202 Geneva Switzerland

Website: http://www.upr-info.org



Phone: + 41 (0) 22 321 77 70

General enquiries info@upr-info.org



http://www.facebook.com/UPRInfo